

Arrest Histories of Men Who Buy Sex



Melissa Farley¹ and Jacqueline M. Golding²

Justice Policy Journal • Volume 16, Number 1 (Spring, 2019)

© Center on Juvenile and Criminal Justice 2019 • www.cjcj.org/jpj

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to compare sex buyers and non-sex-buyers' involvement in criminal activity. Sex buyers were more likely than non-sex buyers to commit felonies, misdemeanors, crimes associated with violence against women, substance abuse-related crimes, assaults, crimes with weapons, crimes against authority, to have been subject to a restraining order, and to have been charged with violence against women. Sex buyers who had more often bought sex had also been arrested more times, were more likely to have been charged with violence against women, and were more likely to have been subject to a restraining order than sex buyers who had less often bought sex. The findings are consistent with the Confluence Model of Sexual Aggression and with other studies of perpetrators of violence against women.

¹ Prostitution Research & Education, San Francisco, CA

² University of California, San Francisco

Corresponding Author: Melissa Farley, mfarley@prostitutionresearch.com

Introduction

This study contributes to a literature that seeks to increase understanding of the perpetrator attributes and contextual factors associated with violence against women. Prostitution, a gendered activity, is linked to high rates of interpersonal violence. In a review of more than a thousand studies, researchers found a high prevalence of violence against those in prostitution in many different settings, with a lifetime prevalence of any or combined violence in prostitution ranging from 45% to 75% (Deering et al., 2014). Half of a sample of Scottish women in prostitution had experienced violence such as being punched, kicked, or attempted rape, in the previous 6 months (Church, Henderson, Barnard, & Hart, 2001). An occupational survey noted that 99% of women in prostitution were victims of violence, and they had more frequent injuries “than workers in [those] occupations considered . . . most dangerous, like mining, forestry and fire fighting” (Brunschot, Sydie, & Krull, 2000). The homicide rate for women in prostitution (204 per 100,000) is many times higher than for male taxicab drivers (29 per 100,000) who are generally considered to be at high risk (Potterat et al., 2004). A review of homicides of women in street prostitution found that they were 60 to 100 times more likely to be murdered than women who were not prostituting (Salfati & James, 2008).

Despite this extraordinarily high incidence of violence, there are relatively few studies focusing on the perpetrators of violence against those in prostitution. An early clinical investigation of sex buyers noted that they had a tendency for immediate gratification combined with a low frustration tolerance, which often led them to criminality (Gibbens & Silberman, 1960). Fifty-four years later, in a review that searched for correlates of violence against sex workers, Deering et al. (2014) noted a persistent lack of information regarding the source of violence against the prostituted. In this article, we will review some of what is known about the nature of violent behaviors committed against women in prostitution, as well as individual and cultural attitudes supportive of that violence. Our focus here is on the delinquency or criminality of the understudied sex buyer.

Theoretical Framework

We use an empirically-based theoretical model for prediction of sexual violence, the multifactorial Confluence Model of Sexual Aggression (Malamuth & Hald, 2017), to predict an association between buying sex and criminal behavior other than soliciting prostitution. The Confluence Model of Sexual Aggression empirically accounts for the complex interrelationship among factors that produce violence against women and has become “the most commonly used etiologic model of

sexual aggression in nonincarcerated populations" (LeBreton, Baysinger, M., Abbey, A., & Jacques-Tiura, 2013, p. 817). When compared to 11 other measures the Confluence Model has been a superior predictor of sexual aggression (Murnen, Wright, & Kaluzny, 2002).

An antisocial orientation mediates two attributes that contribute to the likelihood of sexual aggression in the Confluence Model: hostile masculine self-identification and a preference for impersonal sex (Bramsen et al., 2013; LeBreton et al., 2013; Malamuth & Pitpitan, 2007; Vega & Malamuth, 2007). Hostile masculinity is a personality profile combining a hostile-distrustful orientation with attitudes supporting aggression against women such as rape myth acceptance, and also sexual gratification via the domination of women. Other predictors of sexual aggression in the Confluence Model include pornography use and alcohol consumption (Abbey, Jacques-Tiura, & LeBreton, 2011; Abbey, Wegner, Woerner, Pegram, & Pierce, 2014).

The Confluence Model is applicable to buying sex if prostitution is understood as impersonal sex and/or violence against women, and/or if sex buyers engage in more sexual aggression than do non-sex-buyers. The research described below demonstrates links between buying sex and attitudes supportive of sexual aggression and also links among buying sex, rape, and other criminality.

Pornography use has been associated with sexual aggression (Carr & VanDeusen, 2004; Stotzer & MacCartney, 2016; Vega & Malamuth, 2007). Pornography use has also been associated with buying sex in a study of 110 Scottish sex buyers. The most frequent pornography users were also the most frequent users of women in prostitution (Farley, Macleod, Anderson, & Golding, 2011).

Alcohol use has been associated with sexual assault in a number of cross-sectional studies (Abbey, Wegner, Woerner, & Pierce, 2014) and is an additional factor contributing to the prediction of sexual aggression in the Confluence Model. Alcohol consumption is strongly connected with the impersonal sex factor of the Confluence Model (Abbey, Jacques-Tiura, & LeBreton, 2011).

Buying Sex and Attitudes Supportive of Sexual Aggression

Rape myth acceptance measures rape tolerant attitudes and also attitudes of entitlement to and likelihood of sexual aggression. It is assessed via response to items that justify rape, for example, "women say no but mean yes," "dressing provocatively causes rape," "women lie about having been raped." A number of

studies found a strong link between rape-tolerant attitudes and sexual aggression (Bohner, Jarvis, Eyssele, & Siebler, 2005; Chapleau & Oswald, 2010; Malamuth, Hald, & Koss, 2012; Stotzer & MacCartney, 2016). Arrested sex buyers who most often purchased prostitutes strongly endorsed rape myths (Monto & Hotaling, 1998). Schmidt (2003) found that college-aged men who used women in prostitution reported having committed more sexually coercive behaviors than men who had not used women in prostitution. Support for Schmidt's (2003) findings is found in similar results from Farley et al., (2015) and in Kinnell's (2008) observation that many men who buy sex believe that "buying sex entitles them to do anything they want" or that paying "gave them the right to inflict any kind of assault they chose."

Violence against women has been associated with attitudes that promote men's beliefs that they are entitled to sexual access to women, that they are superior to women, and that they have license for sexual aggression (Koss et al., 1994; Koss & Cleveland, 1997). Sex buyers had higher levels of attitudes known to be associated with sexual aggression: a greater self-reported likelihood to rape, a stronger preference for impersonal sex, greater hostile masculinity, and less empathy for prostituted women (Farley, Golding, Matthews, Malamuth, & Jarrett, 2015). The early cues described as warning signs for rape are behaviors also exhibited by sex buyers in other research: an attitude of sexual entitlement, unwanted touching, persistence, and social isolation (Senn et. al., 2015). There is a positive correlation between ever having bought sex and finding rape generally "appealing" (Sullivan & Simon, 1998).

Buying Sex and Criminality

Buying sex has been linked to a range of antisocial behaviors such as theft, chronic lying, and vandalism (Lussier, Leclerc, Cale, & Proulx, 2007) and rape. In the United States, rapists were more likely than non-rapists to have a history of having bought sex (Lussier, et al., 2007). Among Korean sex offenders, buying sex was positively associated with committing sex crimes (Cho, 2018). In a multi-country study of violence against women, prostitution was consistently associated with intimate partner violence and strongly associated with non-partner rape (Fulu, Warner, Miedema, Jewkes, Roselli, & Lang, 2013). Men who had ever paid for sex were more likely to perpetrate rape than men who had not paid for sex in five samples of 1,000 men each in Chile, Croatia, India, Mexico, and Rwanda (Heilman, Herbert, & Paul-Gera, 2014). In comparable U.S. findings, Monto and McRee (2005) compared 1,672 men who had been arrested for using women in prostitution with men who had not used women in prostitution. Men who were either first time or repeat users of

women in prostitution were more likely to have raped a woman than men who had never used women in prostitution.

Men who ever used women in prostitution committed more sexually aggressive acts against non-prostitute partners than men who had not used women in prostitution (Farley et al., 2015). Men who more frequently used women in prostitution were more likely to have committed sexual aggression against non-prostitute partners than men who had less frequently used women in prostitution (Farley et al., 2011).

Buying sex has also been associated with homicide (Potterat et al., 2004). In Canada and the UK, 62% to 65% of homicides of prostituted women were committed by sex buyers (Kinnell, 2008; Lowman, 2000). In the United States, 57-100% of homicides of prostituted women were committed by sex buyers (Brewer, Dudek, et al., 2007). Brewer, Potterat and colleagues (2007) compared sex buyers who assaulted, raped, and/or killed prostituted women with men who had been arrested for soliciting prostitution but who had not assaulted, raped or killed women in prostitution, finding that the violent sex buyers were more likely to have a history of violent crimes, rape, and property offenses.

Police reports provide evidence for links between buying sex and other criminal activity. Of 518 men who had been arrested for vice-related offenses (usually prostitution) during the previous two years, 12% had a criminal record (Brooks-Gordon, 2006). Of 490 men arrested in 2016-2017 for sex buying in Seattle/King County, Washington, 23% had a prior criminal record (V. Richey, personal communication, April 13, 2018). Details of the types of crimes were not available in either of these data sets. Washington, D.C. police noted that a group of 54 arrested sex buyers were "among the District's most active and violent criminals" who had previous arrests for armed kidnapping (3), assault (4), armed robbery (2), and unregistered gun possession (3), among others (York, 2003). Three of 21 arrested sex buyers in Massachusetts had "long and violent criminal histories, including kidnapping and assault" (Dart, 2015).

The Present Study

There is a need for further research on the criminal history of those who Marttila (2008, p. 34) described as "the invisible subjects of the sex industry." We compared the criminal histories of men who had bought women in prostitution (sex buyers) with the criminal histories of an age-, ethnicity-, and education-matched sample of men who had not used women in prostitution (non-sex-buyers). Monto and McRee

(2005) contrasted two theoretical formulations of the prototypical sex buyer. An everyman perspective imagines sex buyers as being no different from men in general. This perspective would predict no differences in criminal history between sex buyers and men who do not buy sex. Monto and McRee (2005, p. 506) also describe the peculiar man perspective which theorizes that sex buyers "... are characterized by social or personal deficiencies, or other distinctive qualities." We hypothesized that with respect to criminal behavior, the peculiar man perspective is more accurate and that the typical sex buyer is not everyman. Specifically:

1. Based on evidence that sex buyers in prior studies were more likely to have raped, and also based on the Confluence Model's prediction that an antisocial orientation increases the likelihood of sexual aggression via hostile masculinity and a preference for impersonal sex, we predict that sex buyers will be more likely than non-sex-buyers to have a criminal history. If prostitution is not a form of sexual aggression, then the Confluence Model's theoretical formulation will not apply and there will be no difference between sex buyers and non-sex buyers in criminal history;
2. If prostitution itself is a form of sexual aggression, as suggested by research on interpersonal violence that is linked to prostitution, then sex buyers will report a more extensive history of criminal behaviors, operationalized as a larger number of arrests, than non-sex-buyers. If prostitution is banal, and "just another job," then there will be no difference between the criminal histories of sex buyers and non-sex-buyers;
3. If prostitution itself is a form of sexual aggression, then sex buyers' criminal offenses will be more severe than those of non-sex-buyers (as operationalized by rates of self-reported felony convictions). If buying sex is normative male behavior, then there will be no difference between sex buyers and non-sex-buyers in the severity of the two groups' criminal offenses.
4. Given the connection between sexual assault and alcohol consumption, we predict that sex buyers will have a history of more alcohol- or drug- related crimes than non-sex-buyers.

Method

Participants

Recruitment: Respondents were recruited via newspaper (Boston Phoenix) and online (Craigslist) advertisements in Boston, MA seeking adult men (18 and older) for a research study of sexual attitudes and behaviors. The ads noted that the two-

hour, face-to-face interviews were confidential and offered a \$45 honorarium. Interviews were conducted with 101 sex buyers and 101 non-sex-buyers. Non-sex-buyers were matched to sex buyers' age, ethnicity, and education.

Definitions: Sex buyers were defined as those who acknowledged that they had bought sex from a person in prostitution, escort, sex worker, or massage parlor worker or had exchanged something of value (such as food, drugs, or shelter) for a sex act. Non-sex-buyers were men who had not bought a sex worker, massage sex worker, or escort, phone sex, or a lap dance; had not been to a strip club more than once in the past year; had not exchanged something of value for a sex act, and had not used pornography more than once in the past week. We consider pornography to be sexually exploitive and a form of prostitution; in practice, pornography is filmed prostitution and integral to the sex trade. From the perspective of the person in the sex trade, pornography is experienced as an act of prostitution. A survivor of prostitution explained, "Pornography is prostitution that is legalized as long as someone gets to take pictures." Because pornography use is commonplace, we were concerned that if we required no pornography use at all, there would be insufficient numbers of men to constitute our non-sex-buyer group. Our decision to include men who used pornography once a week or less frequently was based on data from two studies of the prevalence of pornography use among college men. Among 595 men, 76% were using pornography on the Internet (N. Malamuth, personal communication, September 7, 2009), and in another study, 48% of 313 men aged 18-26 used pornography once a week or more often (Carroll et al., 2008).

Sampling: We conducted phone screenings of 1247 men to select for the two groups (sex buyers and non-sex-buyers) and to match the two groups on age, ethnicity, and education. We matched participants on these attributes so that any group differences between sex buyers and non-sex-buyers could not be attributed to differences between our two groups in age, ethnicity, or education. Brewer for example, found that the sex buyers they sampled were younger, more likely to be Black or Hispanic, and less educated than non-sex-buyers (Brewer, Potterat, et al., 2007). We used guidelines from the Massachusetts Census to establish approximate size of ethnic groups (U.S. Census Bureau, 2000; Metro Boston Data Common, 2010) so that the sample would be as demographically representative as possible of the population from which it was drawn. Ethnicity was categorized as African American, Asian or Pacific Islander, Latino or Hispanic, Native American, White European American or Caucasian, or Multiracial, and collapsed to three categories for analysis because of small cell sizes: African American, European American, other. Our groups were matched within 5 years on age. We classified five

levels of education: less than high school diploma or GED, high school diploma/GED, some college, college degree, graduate or professional degree.

Participant Characteristics: Mean age was 41 (range 20 - 75) for sex buyers and 40 (range 18 - 77) for non-sex-buyers, $t(199) = -0.067, p = .505$. Median annual family income was about \$40,000, with no significant difference between sex buyers and non-sex-buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 199) = 2.264, p = .132$. About a third of each group had a college degree (32% of sex buyers, 33% of non-sex-buyers), a third reported some college education without a degree (36% of sex buyers, 34% of non-sex-buyers) and about one-tenth indicated a graduate or professional degree (12% of non-sex-buyers and 11% of non-sex-buyers), $\chi^2(4, N = 200) = 0.500, p = .974$. Slightly more than half of each group (56% of sex buyers, 58% of non-sex-buyers) were European American, about one-third were African American (32% of sex buyers, 31% of non-sex-buyers), and smaller proportions of the sample were Latino or Hispanic (6% of sex buyers, 4% of non-sex-buyers), multiracial (4% of sex buyers, 6% of non-sex-buyers), Native American (2% of sex buyers, 0% of non-sex-buyers), or Asian or Pacific Islander (0% of sex buyers, 1% of non-sex-buyers), $\chi^2(2, N = 201) = 0.133, p = .936$.

A large majority of the men (89% of sex buyers and 93% of non-sex-buyers) identified as heterosexual, with fewer identifying as homosexual (4% of sex buyers and 3% of non-sex-buyers) or bisexual (7% of sex buyers and 4% of non-sex-buyers). No respondents in either group identified as transgender. Sixty-one percent of sex buyers and 70% of non-sex-buyers currently had a wife or girlfriend, $\chi^2(1, N = 199) = 1.800, p = .180$.

Procedure

Interviewees, who were anonymous, provided informed consent and were given contact information for a social worker who was available in the event of distress. The research protocol received IRB approval from the Prostitution Research & Education Ethics Review Committee and by the Pacific Graduate School of Psychology Institutional Review Board. Other results from this study's database have been published previously (Farley et al., 2015).

Measures

We administered quantitative and qualitative measures as part of individual, face-to-face, structured interviews. This interview protocol has been used in previous studies of sex buyers (e.g. Farley et al., 2011).

Arrest history was assessed using the question, "Have you ever been arrested?" Those responding "yes" to this question were asked follow-up questions that

included number of lifetime arrests ("If yes, how many times?"), type of charge ("What were you charged with?"), conviction history ("Have you been convicted?"), number of convictions ("How many times?"), type of misdemeanors ("If yes, what misdemeanors?"), and type of felonies ("If yes, what felonies?"). All of the men were asked, "Have you been charged with an act of violence against a woman?" and "Have you had a court injunction / restraining order against you directing you to either stay away from someone or not be violent?"

Men who reported any arrests were also asked about their history of arrests for buying women in prostitution ("Have you been arrested for soliciting a woman in prostitution?"). Men who responded "yes" to this item were asked about the location and outcome of the arrest.

Results

Arrest History

Sixty-three percent of the sex buyers had ever been arrested for any crime, compared to 47% of the non-sex-buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 200) = 5.17, p = 0.023$. Of the men who had ever been arrested, sex buyers averaged 11.66 arrests (SD = 19.97, range 0 - 120, median = 6, mode = 1), whereas non-sex-buyers had been arrested an average of 4.74 times (SD = 5.49, range 0 - 25, median = 2, mode = 1), $t(101.25) = -2.63, p = .010$.

Although conviction rates were comparable among sex buyers and non-sex-buyers who had ever been arrested (68% of sex buyers and 60% of non-sex-buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 105) = 0.59, p = .443$), there were other differences between the two groups. Of the sex buyers, 32.7% had a history of either a felony or a misdemeanor, or both, compared to 14.9% of non-sex-buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 202) = 8.854, p = .0029$. Twenty-two percent of the sex buyers had at least one felony conviction, compared to 8% of the non-sex-buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 202) = 7.67, p = .006$. Twenty-three percent of the sex buyers had at least one misdemeanor conviction, compared to 10% of non-sex-buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 202) = 6.12, p = .013$. Twenty-four percent of sex buyers had been subject to a restraining order, compared to 9% of the non-sex-buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 198) = 7.82, p = 0.005$. Fourteen percent of the sex buyers, in comparison to 4% of the non-sex-buyers, had a history of charges of violence against women, $\chi^2(1, N = 199) = 5.998, p = 0.014$.

While only 5% of the sex buyers reported having been arrested for solicitation of prostitution, they reported buying sex on many occasions. The sex buyers reported having used women in prostitution on average 54 times ($n = 99$, median = 12, mode

= 1). Their total number of visits to women in prostitution ranged from once to 600 times.

Arrest History and Frequency of Use of Women in Prostitution

To evaluate the association of frequency of buying sex with criminal history we compared sex buyers in the highest tertile of frequency of buying sex (more than 30 times in their lifetime) with those who had bought sex fewer than 30 times. Sex buyers with a more extensive history of using women in prostitution (45.2%) were more likely than men with a less extensive history (14.8%) to have been subject to a restraining order, $\chi^2(1, N = 92) = 10.1357, p = 0.001$ and were more likely to have been charged with crimes of violence against women, 25.8% compared to 9.8%, $\chi^2(1, N = 92) = 4.0634, p = 0.0438$. The more frequent sex buyers also had a higher mean number of lifetime arrests (16.7, SD = 26.1) than the less frequent sex buyers, (10.0, SD = 17.3), $t(54) = -2.44, p = 0.0182$. There was no significant difference between the more and less frequent sex buyers in prevalence of any arrest history (66.7% of more frequent vs. 59.7% of less-frequent sex buyers, $\chi^2(1, N = 92) = 0.419, p = .517$), history of felony arrest (22.6% of each group, $\chi^2(1, N = 93) = 0.000, p = 1.000$), history of misdemeanor arrest (29.0% vs. 16.1%, $\chi^2(1, N = 93) = 1.848, p = .174$), or history of conviction among sex buyers with an arrest history (72.2% vs. 73.7%), $\chi^2(1, N = 55) = 0.013, p = .908$.

Categories of Arrests

In descriptive analyses, we compared the types of crimes for which the men reported arrest. Sex buyers were more likely to report every category of crime except for robbery (see *Table 1*). Former Chief of the Special Victims Bureau of the Queens (New York) District Attorney's Office Alice Vachss noted that crimes such as impersonating a police officer or lewd and lascivious behavior have been empirically linked to violence against women (A. Vachss, personal communication, 2011). None of the non-sex-buyers had committed a crime of violence against women or a crime that was associated by sex crime prosecutors with violence against women (VAWA), but there were six reports of these VAWA crimes among the 63 sex buyers who had ever been arrested (see *Table 1*).

The 101 sex buyers reported 30 arrests for substance-use-related crimes, an average of 0.30 per respondent, most commonly possession of marijuana (n=4), driving under the influence (n=3), and drinking (n=3) or drunk (n=2) in public. In contrast, the 101 non-sex-buyers reported 6 arrests for substance-use-related crimes, an average of 0.06 per respondent, with possession of marijuana (n=2) the most commonly reported of these crimes in this group. Although no formal tests of statistical significance were possible because of the small numbers, substance-use-

related crimes were five times more common among the sex buyers than the non-sex-buyers.

Table 1 Crimes Committed by Sex Buyers Compared to Non-Sex Buyers

| Type of Crime | Sex Buyers* | Non Sex-Buyers** | Type of Crime | Sex Buyers* | Non Sex-Buyers** |
|---------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|------------------|
| VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN or Associated with VAWA - Total | 6 | 0 | ROBBERY - Total | 2 | 2 |
| <i>Impersonating a police officer</i> | 1 | 0 | <i>Conspiracy to commit robbery</i> | 0 | 1 |
| <i>Violating a restraining order</i> | 1 | 0 | <i>Armed robbery</i> | 0 | 0 |
| <i>Indecent exposure – public urinating</i> | 1 | 0 | <i>Unarmed robbery</i> | 1 | 1 |
| <i>Intimidating witnesses</i> | 1 | 0 | <i>Robbery</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Lewd and lascivious behavior</i> | 1 | 0 | Robbery Total | 2 | 2 |
| <i>Destruction of property</i> | 1 | 0 | BURGLARY - Total | 4 | 1 |
| VAWA Crimes Total | 6 | 0 | <i>Breaking and entering</i> | 4 | 1 |
| ASSAULT - Total | 14 | 6 | Burglary Total | 4 | 1 |
| <i>Assault and battery on police officer</i> | 2 | 1 | PROPERTY CRIMES - Total | 7 | 1 |
| <i>Attempted murder</i> | 2 | 0 | <i>Shoplifting</i> | 2 | 0 |
| <i>Assault and battery</i> | 6 | 2 | <i>Theft</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Assault and battery with a weapon</i> | 2 | 1 | <i>Selling balloons without a permit</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Resisting arrest</i> | 1 | 0 | <i>Larceny over \$1,200</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Resisting arrest</i> | 1 | 0 | <i>Fare evasion on the train</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Hit and run</i> | 1 | 0 | <i>Breaking into safe deposit box</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Assault but charges were dropped</i> | 0 | 1 | <i>Larceny by check bouncing</i> | 0 | 1 |
| <i>Shoplifting/fighting</i> | 0 | 1 | Property Crimes Total | 7 | 1 |
| Assault Total | 14 | 6 | CRIMES AGAINST AUTHORITY Defying Police/Parole Officer | 3 | 0 |
| WEAPONS | 3 | 1 | <i>Disobeying a police officer</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Possession of a firearm</i> | 2 | 0 | <i>Evading police</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Carrying a concealed weapon</i> | 1 | 1 | <i>Parole violation</i> | 1 | 0 |
| Weapons Total | 3 | 1 | Crimes vs Authority Total | 3 | 0 |

| Type of Crime | Sex Buyers* | Non Sex-Buyers** |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|------------------|
| CRIMES AGAINST AUTHORITY Disorderly Conduct, Driving Infractions - Total | 13 | 3 |
| <i>Disorderly conduct</i> | 4 | 0 |
| <i>Drunk in public</i> | 3 | 0 |
| <i>Drinking in public</i> | 2 | 0 |
| <i>Disturbing the peace</i> | 0 | 1 |
| <i>Driver's License suspended</i> | 1 | 1 |
| <i>Open Container</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Camping in illegal area</i> | 0 | 1 |
| <i>Driving without a license</i> | 2 | 0 |
| Crimes vs. Authority Total | 13 | 3 |

*Sex Buyers n=63; **Non Sex-Buyers n=47

| Type of Crime | Sex Buyers* | Non Sex-Buyers** |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------|------------------|
| SUBSTANCE ABUSE Drug Sales, Drunk Driving, Drug Paraphernalia - Total | 23 | 6 |
| <i>Possession with intent to distribute oxycontin</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Possession with intent to distribute cocaine</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Drug trafficking</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Distribution - crack cocaine</i> | 2 | 0 |
| <i>Distribution in school zone - drug trafficking</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Drunk driving or DUI</i> | 5 | 1 |
| <i>Attempting to commit suicide - driving over 100 mph</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Driving under influence of narcotics</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Drug possession - heroin</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Drug possession - oxycontin</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Drug possession</i> | 2 | 2 |
| <i>Possession of hypodermic needle</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Possession of drug paraphernalia</i> | 1 | 0 |
| <i>Drug Possession - marijuana</i> | 4 | 2 |
| Substance Abuse Total | 23 | 6 |

Discussion

In a matched sample of 101 sex buyers and 101 men who chose not to buy sex, sex buyers reported having committed more crimes, including felonies, misdemeanors, crimes associated with violence against women, assaults, crimes with weapons, crimes against authority, burglaries, and substance abuse-related crimes. The only category of crime in which there was no difference between the groups was robbery. Our findings are consistent with Hypotheses 1, 2, and 3, which predicted that compared to non-sex-buyers, the sex buyers would be more likely to have a criminal history, would have a more extensive criminal history (i.e. more arrests), and would have a history of more severe offenses (i.e. more felonies). These hypotheses are consistent with other research documenting links between buying

sex and a greater likelihood of other criminal history (Cho, 2018; Fulu et al., 2013; Heilman et al., 2014; Lussier et al., 2007; Monto & McRee, 2005).

The finding that sex buyers have engaged in more criminal acts than non-sex-buyers suggests a need for greater public and criminal justice system awareness of the violence that is endemic to the sex trade (Choi, Klein, Shin, & Lee, 2009; Deer, 2010; Farley et al., 2015; Hoigard & Finstad, 1986; MacKinnon, 2011; Potterat et al., 2004; Widom & Kuhns, 1996).

The Confluence Model (Malamuth & Hald, 2017) is an appropriate theoretical and empirical model once prostitution is understood as a form of violence against women, and/or if sex buyers engage in more sexual aggression than non-sex-buyers. Since the Confluence Model identifies impersonal sex as a risk factor for violence against women, to the extent that prostitution is itself impersonal sex, sex buyers are more likely to commit sexual aggression. Sex buyers' greater criminality and more frequent receipt of charges of violence against women are consistent with the Confluence Model's identification of an antisocial orientation as a risk factor for violence against women (Malamuth & Hald, 2017; Malamuth & Pitpitan, 2007).

Sex buyers interviewed in this study reported many undetected prostitution offenses. Skeptical of arrested sex buyers' allegations that they had not previously bought sex, Chicago law enforcement officers suggested that almost all arrested sex buyers had engaged in prostitution on numerous prior occasions (Alter, 2016). Lisak and Miller (2002) found that rapists also tend to be multiple offenders of undetected rapes.

Consistent with Hypothesis 4, sex buyers were more likely to have a history of substance-use-related arrests than were non-sex-buyers. This finding is consistent with research documenting alcohol use as a risk factor for violence against women.

Limitations of this Research

It is possible that men who respond to advertisements requesting participation in research on sexual attitudes and behaviors may differ in unknown ways from the general population of men, including general populations of sex buyers. It is not possible to obtain a random sample of men who buy sex (Faugier & Cranfield, 1995; McKeganey & Barnard, 1996). Given the logistical difficulties of obtaining a sample of men who buy sex who are representative of the general population of sex buyers, the present study's sampling explores a different population from previous studies using samples of men who had been arrested for buying sex. This is

important because we found that a majority of sex buyers had never been arrested for soliciting prostitution.

The importance of including samples of non-arrested men in studies of sex buyers is highlighted by Monto and McRee (2005), who compared arrested sex buyers to a national sample of men which included both sex buyers and non-sex-buyers. In one analysis, the arrested sex buyers who responded to questions while in a police-sponsored program were less likely to report that they had ever forced a woman to have sex (i.e. rape) (0.9%) than were the men in the national sample (3.0%, $p < .001$; *Table 1*, p. 515, columns I and III). However, when Monto and McRee (2005) conducted a second set of analyses, separating the sex buyers and non-sex-buyers in the national sample, and comparing them to arrested sex buyers (*Table 2*, p. 520, columns I and II), a result consistent with findings in the present study emerged: within the national sample, the sex buyers (8.8%) were five times as likely as the non-sex buyers (1.7%) to report having coerced a woman to have sex, $p < .001$. This analysis "presents the most useful and informative contrasts," in Monto and McRee's words (2005, p. 521).

Previous studies of sex buyers tended not to include comparison groups of demographically similar men who did not buy sex, thus precluding a contextual understanding of arrest rates (when no comparison groups were used). The lack of matched comparison in other studies may have permitted unmeasured potential group differences such as age, ethnicity, or educational level to influence results. The significant differences we found between the two groups of men in the present study could not have been caused by differences between sex buyers and non-sex-buyers in age, ethnicity, and/or educational level.

All of the information collected in the present study was obtained by self-report. It is likely that both sex buyers and non-sex buyers attempted to some extent to appear socially desirable, a common response set on self-report measures (Crowne & Marlowe, 1964). We therefore assume that all responses in the study tended to minimize endorsements of socially undesirable phenomena such as criminal history. We assume with some confidence that the numbers reported in this study are likely to be underestimates.

Policy Implications

Deering et al. (2014) reviewed the quantitative and qualitative literature for "factors that shape risk for violence against sex workers." These factors included policy environments in which prostitution occurred, regardless of its legal status or physical location. Prostitution is a rape-facilitating environment. "By classifying

some women as justifiable recipients of unwanted sex, sexually aggressive men are given permission to view coercive actions against these women not as extreme and unacceptable but as part of and consistent with 'normal' male sexuality" (Koss & Cleveland, 1997, p. 9). Further investigation of prostitution as a practice of socially sanctioned, paid-for sexual aggression is warranted. Even though prostitution is illegal in most of the United States, law enforcement practices often ignore the illegal behavior of men who buy adult women for sex. Flood & Pease (2009, p. 136) note that "criminal justice systems may have a negative influence on attitudes when they fail to respond appropriately to the victims and perpetrators of violence against women." Instead of victim interrogations, it is more appropriate to interrogate sex buyers who often have extensive information about pimps, coercion, trafficking, and the harms of prostitution that could be useful to law enforcement personnel.

References

- Abbey, A., Jacques-Tiura, A.J., & LeBreton, J.M. (2011). Risk factors for sexual aggression in young men: An expansion of the Confluence Model. *Aggressive Behavior, 37*, 450 - 464. <https://doi.org/10.002/ab.20399>
- Abbey, A., Wegner, R., Woerner, J., Pegram, S. E., & Pierce, J. (2014). Review of survey and experimental research that examines the relationship between alcohol consumption and men's sexual aggression perpetration. *Trauma, Violence and Abuse, 15*, 265 - 282. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1524838014521031>
- Adams, K. (2004). Developmental aspects of adult crime. In T. Thornberry (Ed.,) *Developmental theories of crime and delinquency* (pp. 309 - 342). New York: Routledge.
- Alter, C. (2016). Catching johns: Inside the national push to arrest men who buy sex. *Time*. Retrieved from <http://time.com/sex-buyers-why-cops-across-the-u-s-target-men-who-buy-prostitutes/>
- Bohner, G., Jarvis, C. I., Eyssel, F., & Siebler, F. (2005). The causal impact of rape myth acceptance on men's rape proclivity: Comparing sexually coercive and noncoercive men. *European Journal of Social Psychology, 35*, 819-828. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ejsp.284>
- Bramsen, R. H., Lasgaard, M., Koss, M. P., Dhevlin, M., Elkit, A., & Banner, J. (2013). Testing a multiple mediator model of the effect of childhood sexual abuse on adolescent sexual victimization. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry, 83*, 47 - 54. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ajop.12011>

- Brewer, D. D., Dudek, J. A., Potterat, J. J., Muth, S. Q., Roberts, J. M. J., & Woodhouse, D. A. (2007). Extent, trends, and perpetrators of prostitution-related homicide in the United States. In D. D. Brewer, J. J. Potterat, S. Q. Muth, J. M. J. Roberts & J. A. W. Dudek, D. A. (Eds.), *Clients of prostitute women: Deterrence, prevalence, characteristics, and violence* (U. S. Department of Justice report 218253) (pp. 4-1 – 4-44). Retrieved from National Criminal Justice Reference Service website: <https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/218253.pdf>
- Brewer, D. D., Potterat, J. J., Muth, S. Q., Roberts, J. M. J., Dudek, J. A., & Woodhouse, D. A. (2007). *Clients of prostitute women: Deterrence, prevalence, characteristics, and violence* (U.S. Department of Justice report 218253) . Retrieved from National Criminal Justice Reference Service website: <https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/218253.pdf>
- Brooks-Gordon, B. (2006). *The price of sex: Prostitution, policy and society*. Collompton, UK: Willan.
- Brunschot, E. G. V., Sydie, R. A., & Krull, C. (2000). Images of prostitution: The prostitute and print media. *Women & Criminal Justice*, 10, 47 - 72.
- Cale, J., Lussier, P., & Proulx, J. (2009). Heterogeneity in antisocial trajectories in youth of adult sexual aggressors of women: An examination of initiation, persistence, escalation, and aggravation. *Sexual Abuse: A Journal of Research and Treatment*, 21, 223 - 248. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1079063209333134>
- Carr, J. L., & VanDeusen, K. M. (2004). Risk factors for male sexual aggression on college campuses. *Journal of Family Violence*, 19, 279-289. <https://doi.org/10.1023/B:JOFV.0000042078>
- Carroll, J. S., Padilla-Walker, L. M., Nelson, L. J., Olson, C. D., Barry, C. M., & Madsen, S. D. (2008). Generation XXX: Pornography acceptance and use among emerging adults. *Journal of Adolescent Research*, 23, 6-30.
- Chapleau, K. M., & Oswald, D. L. (2010). Power, sex, and rape myth acceptance: Testing two models of rape proclivity. *Journal of Sex Research*, 47, 66-78. doi:10.1080/00224490902954323
- Cho, S.-Y. (2018) An analysis of sexual violence: The relationship between sex crimes and prostitution in South Korea. *Asian Development Perspectives*, 9,12-34.
- Choi, H., Klein, C., Shin, M., & Lee, H. (2009). Posttraumatic stress disorder (PTSD) and disorders of extreme stress (DESNOS) symptoms following prostitution and childhood abuse. *Violence Against Women*, 15, 933-951.

- Church, S., Henderson, M., Barnard, M., & Hart, G. (2001). Violence by clients towards female prostitutes in different work settings: questionnaire survey. *British Medical Journal*, 322 (7285), 524 - 525.
- Cotton, A., Farley, M., & Baron, R. (2002). Attitudes toward prostitution and acceptance of rape myths. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology*, 32, 1 - 8.
- Crowne, D. P., & Marlowe, D. (1964). *The approval motive: Studies in evaluative dependence*. New York: Wiley.
- Dart, T. J. (2015, February 3). CPD vice arrest 16 for soliciting and related charges during 9th annual "National Day of John Arrests". Cincinnati Police Department Patrol Bureau, from <https://local.nixle.com/alert/5349506/>
- Deer, S. (2010). Relocation revisited: Sex trafficking of Native women in the United States. *William Mitchell Law Review*, 36, 621-682.
- Deering, K. N., Amin, A., Shoveller, J., Nesbitt, A., Garcia-Moreno, C., Duff, P., Argento, E., . . . Shannon, K. (2014) A systematic review of the correlates of violence against sex workers. *American Journal of Public Health*, 104, e42-e54. Retrieved from <https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC3987574/>
- Farley, M, Deer, S., Golding, J.M., Matthews, N., Lopez, G., Stark, C., & Hudon, E. (2016). The prostitution and trafficking of American Indian/Alaska Native Women in Minnesota. *American Indian and Alaska Native Mental Health Research*, 23, 65-104. <https://doi.org/10.5820/aian.2301.2016.65>.
- Farley, M., Golding, J. M., Matthews, E. S., Malamuth, N. M., & Jarrett, L. (2015). Comparing sex buyers with men who do not buy sex: New data on prostitution and trafficking. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 1-25. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260515600874>
- Farley, M., Lynne, J., & Cotton, A. (2005). Prostitution in Vancouver: Violence and the Colonization of First Nations women. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, , 242 - 271. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461505052667>
- Farley, M., Macleod, J., Anderson, L., & Golding, J. M. (2011). Attitudes and social characteristics of men who buy sex in Scotland. *Psychological Trauma: Theory, Research, Practice, and Policy*, 3/4, 369-383. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0022645>
- Faugier, J., & Cranfield, S. (1995). Reaching male clients of female prostitutes: The challenge for HIV prevention. *AIDS Care: Psychological and Socio-Medical Aspects of AIDS/HIV*, 7, 21-32.

- Flood, M., & Pease, B. (2009). Factors influencing attitudes to violence against women. *Trauma Violence and Abuse*, 10, 125 - 142.
- Fulu, ., Warner, X., Miedema, S., Jewkes, R., Roselli, T. and Lang, J. (2013). Why Do Some Men Use Violence Against Women and How Can We Prevent It? Summary Report of Quantitative Findings from the United Nations Multi-country Study on Men and Violence in Asia and the Pacific. Bangkok: United Nations Development Fund, United Nations Population Fund, United Nations Women and United Nations Volunteers. Retrieved from [http://www.svri.org/sites/default/files/attachments/2016-07-19/RBAP- Gender-2013-P4P-VAW-Report-Summary.pdf](http://www.svri.org/sites/default/files/attachments/2016-07-19/RBAP-Gender-2013-P4P-VAW-Report-Summary.pdf)
- Gibbens, T.C.N., & Silberman, M. (1960). The clients of prostitutes. *British Journal of Venereal Disease*, 36, 113 - 117.
- Hare, R. D., Harpur, T. J. , Hakstian, A. R., Forth, A. E., Hart, S. D., & Newman JP. (1990). The revised psychopathy checklist: Descriptive statistics, reliability, and factor structure. *Psychological Assessment: A Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology*, 2, 338 - 341.
- Heilman, B., Herbert, L., & Paul-Gera, N. (2014). The making of sexual violence: How does a boy grow up to commit rape? Evidence from five IMAGES countries. Washington, DC: International Center for Research on Women. Retrieved from <http://www.icrw.org/files/publications/The%20Making%20Of%20Sexual%20Violence%20-%20June%202014%20-%20WEB%20PREVIEW.pdf>
- Hoigard, C., & Finstad, L. (1986). *Backstreets: Prostitution, money, and love*. University Park, PA: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Jovanovski, N. & Tyler, M. (2018, March 16). "Bitch, you got what you deserved!": Violation and violence in sex buyer reviews of legal brothels. *Violence Against Women*. Advance online publication. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077801218757375>
- Kinnell, H. (2008). *Violence and sex work in Britain*. Cullompton, Devon: Willan.
- Koss, M. P., & Cleveland, H. H. (1997). Stepping on toes: Social roots of date rape lead to intractability and politicization. In M. D. Schwartz (Ed.), *Researching sexual violence against women: Methodological and personal perspectives* (pp. 4-21). London: Sage.
- Koss, M.P., Goodman, A., Browne, L., Fitzgerald, G., Keita, G., & Russo, N. (1994). *No safe haven*. Washington, DC: American Psychological Association.

-
- LeBreton, J. M., Baysinger, M., Abbey, A., & Jacques-Tiura, A. J. (2013). The relative importance of psychopathy-related traits in predicting impersonal sex and hostile masculinity. *Personality and Individual Differences, 55*, 817-822.
- Lisak, D., & Miller, P. M. (2002). Repeat rape and multiple offending among undetected rapists. *Violence and Victims, 17*, 73-84.
- Lowman, J. (2000). Violence and the outlaw status of (street) prostitution in Canada. *Violence Against Women, 6*, 987-1011.
- Lussier, P., Leclerc, B., Cale, J., & Proulx, J. (2007). Developmental pathways of deviance in sexual aggressors. *Criminal Justice and Behavior, 34*, 1441-1462. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0093854807306350>
- MacKinnon, C. A. (2005). Pornography as trafficking. *Michigan Journal of International Law, 26*, 993.
- MacKinnon, C. A. (2011). Trafficking, prostitution, and inequality. *Harvard Civil Rights-Civil Liberties Law Review, 271*, 271-309.
- Malamuth, N. M., & Hald, G. M. (2017). The Confluence Mediation Model of Sexual Aggression. In A. R. Beech & T. Ward (Eds.), *The Wiley Handbook on the Theories, Assessment and Treatment of Sexual Offending: Vol. I: Theories* (2nd edition) (pp. 53-71). Oxford, UK: Wiley.
- Malamuth, N. M., Hald, G. M., & Koss, M. (2012). Pornography, individual differences in risk and men's acceptance of violence against women in a representative sample. *Sex Roles, 66*, 427-439.
- Malamuth, N. M., Heavey, C.L., & Linz, C. (1993). Predicting men's antisocial behavior against women: The Interaction Model of Sexual Aggression. In G. C. N. Hall, R. Hirschman, J. R. Graham, & M. S. Zaragoza (eds.). *Sexual aggression: Issues in etiology, assessment, and treatment* (pp. 63-98). Washington D.C.: Taylor & Francis.
- Malamuth, N. M., & Pitpitan, E. V. (2007). The effects of pornography are moderated by men's sexual aggression risk. In D. Guinn & J. DiCaro (Eds.), *Pornography: Driving the demand in international sex trafficking* (pp. 125-143). Chicago: International Human Rights Law Institute and Captive Daughters Media.
- Marttila, A.-M. (2008). Desiring the "other": Prostitution clients on a transnational red-light district in the border area of Finland, Estonia and Russia. *Gender Technology and Development, 12*, 31 - 51. <https://doi.org/10.1177/097185240701200104>

- McKeganey, N., & Barnard, M. (1996). *Sex work on the streets: Prostitutes and their clients*. Berkshire: Open University Press.
- Metro Boston Data Common (2010). Population by race/ethnicity for 2000 and 2010. Retrieved from <http://metro.boston.datacommon.org/datasets/fc9cb690-93f1-4d9a-bad9-b3283aedba8c>
- Monto, M., & Hotaling, N. (1998, April). Predictors of rape myth acceptance among the male clients of female street prostitutes. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Pacific Sociological Association, San Francisco, CA.
- Monto, M. A., & McRee, N. (2005). A comparison of the male customers of female street prostitutes with national samples of men. *International Journal of Offender Therapy and Comparative Criminology*, 49, 505-529.
- Murnen, S. K., & Kohlman, M. H. (2007). Athletic participation, fraternity membership, and sexual aggression among college men: A meta-analytic review. *Sex Roles*, 57, 145-157.
- Murnen, S. K., Wright, C., & Kaluzny, G. (2002). If "boys will be boys," then girls will be victims? A meta-analytic review of the research that relates masculine ideology to sexual aggression. *Sex Roles*, , 359 - 375.
<https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1020488928736>
- Mustaine, E. E., & Tewksbury, R. (2002). Sexual assault of college women: A feminist interpretation of a routine activities analysis. *Criminal Justice Review*, 27, 89 - 123. <https://doi.org/10.1177/073401680202700106>
- Potterat, J. J., Brewer, D. D., Muth, S. Q., Rothenberg, R. B., Woodhouse, D. A. Y., Muth, J. B., & Brody, S. (2004). Mortality in a long-term open cohort of prostitute women. *American Journal of Epidemiology*, 159, 778-785.
<https://doi.org/10.1093/aje/kwh110s>
- Salfati, C. G., & James, A. R. (2008). Prostitute homicides: A descriptive study. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 23, 505 - 543.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/0886260507312946>
- Schmidt, Megan A. (2003). Attitudes toward prostitution and self-reported sexual violence in college men (Doctoral dissertation, Pacific University). Retrieved from <http://commons.pacificu.edu/spp/673>
- Schwartz, M. D., DeKeseredy, W. S., Tait, D., & Alvi, S. (2001). Male peer support and feminist routine activities theory: Understanding sexual assault on the college campus. *Justice Quarterly*, 18, 623-649.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/07418820100095041>

- Senn, C. Y., Eliasziw, M., Barata, P. C., Thurston, W. E., Newby-Clark, I. R., Radtke, H. L., & Hobden, K. L. (2015). Efficacy of a sexual assault resistance program for university women. *New England Journal of Medicine*, 372, 2326 - 2335. <https://doi.org/10.1056/nejmc1509345>
- Silbert, M. H. & Pines, A. M. (1982). Victimization of street prostitutes. *Victimology*, 7, 122 - 133.
- Simmons, C.A., Lehmann, P., & Collier-Tenison, S. (2008). Linking male use of the sex industry to controlling behaviors in violent relationships: An exploratory analysis. *Violence Against Women*, 14, 406 - 417.
- Stotzer, R. L., & MacCartney, D. (2016). The role of institutional factors in on-campus reported rape prevalence. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 31, 2687 - 2707.
- Sullivan, E., & Simon, W. (1998). The client: A social, psychological, and behavioral look at the unseen patron of prostitution. In J. E. Elias, V. L. Bulloch, V. Elias, & G. Brewer (Eds.), *Prostitution: On whores, hustlers, and johns* (pp.134-154). New York: Prometheus.
- U. S. Census Bureau (2000). Census 2000 data for the state of Massachusetts. Retrieved from <https://www.census.gov/census2000/states/ma.html>.
- Vega, V., & Malamuth, N. M. (2007). Predicting sexual aggression: the role of pornography in the context of general and specific risk factors. *Aggressive Behavior*, 33, 104-117. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ab.20172>
- Widom, C. S., & Kuhns, J. B. (1996). Childhood victimization and subsequent risk for promiscuity, prostitution, and teenage pregnancy: A prospective study. *American Journal of Public Health*, 86, 1607-1612. <https://doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.86.11.1607>
- York, J. (2003, July 18). Police take aim at johns to cut crime. *Washington Times*. Retrieved from <https://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2003/jul/18/20030718-112350-1862r/>

About the Authors

Melissa Farley, Ph.D. Executive Director, Prostitution Research & Education, San Francisco, CA, mfarley@prostitutionresearch.com.

Jacqueline M. Golding, Ph.D. Professor Emeritus, Institute for Health & Aging, University of California, San Francisco, jacquelinegoldingphd@gmail.com.