

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

Coordination des Organisation Musulmanes de Centrafrique (COMUC) wishes to provide input regarding the Special Rapporteur on freedom of religion or belief's upcoming report on transformative responses to the advocacy of hatred based on religion or belief. The following report describes the instances and effects of hatred and discrimination against Muslims in the Central African Republic (CAR) in the areas of (1) legal recognition, (2) education, (3) healthcare, (4) freedom of movement, and (5) life, liberty, and security. This submission represents COMUC's responses to questions 2 and 4 of the call for input.

I. Violations of the Right to Legal Recognition

The government of CAR violates Muslim Central Africans' right to legal recognition, particularly by failing to guarantee their right to access government-issued identity documents.¹ This right is essential for exercising other basic rights, including freedom of movement. This section explains how the right is violated and the barriers Muslims face in accessing their documents, including: (1) illegal and discriminatory requirements; (2) harassment; and (3) corruption.

The *Carte nationale d'identité* (CNI) is the primary national identity document in CAR. It is important for many activities, such as traveling around the country, opening a bank account, and voting.² The national identity card also carries significant symbolic value of what it means to be Central African.³ Muslims experience "great difficulty and hassle" in obtaining CNIs compared to the rest of the population.⁴

¹ The right to access government-issued identity documents is an essential component of the right to recognition, fundamental to ensuring non-discrimination and access to rights. U.N. Comm. on Elimination of Racial Discrimination, *Concluding Observations on the Twenty-Second and Twenty-Third Periodic Reports of Ukraine*, ¶¶ 19–22, U.N. Doc. CERD/C/UKR/CO/22-23 (Oct. 4, 2016), <https://www.refworld.org/docid/57d68ed34.html>; U.N. Hum. Rts. Comm., *Concluding Observations on the Seventh Periodic Report of Ukraine*, ¶ 12, U.N. Doc. CCPR/C/UKR/CO/7 (Aug. 22, 2013), [https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/TreatyBodyExternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/UKR/CO/7&Lang=En;U.N. Dep't Econ. & Soc. Affs. Stat. Div., Principles and Recommendations for a Vital Statistics System, ¶ 286, Statistical Papers Series No. 19/Rev. 3 \(Oct. 2014\), <https://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/standmeth/principles/m19rev3en.pdf>.](https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/TreatyBodyExternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=CCPR/C/UKR/CO/7&Lang=En;U.N. Dep't Econ. & Soc. Affs. Stat. Div., Principles and Recommendations for a Vital Statistics System, ¶ 286, Statistical Papers Series No. 19/Rev. 3 (Oct. 2014), https://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/standmeth/principles/m19rev3en.pdf)

² *Pourquoi la Carte Nationale d'Identité Ne Se Délivre Plus?*, LE POTENTIEL CENTRAFRICAÏN (Apr. 2, 2020), <https://lepotentielcentrafricain.com/centrafrique-pourquoi-la-carte-nationale-didentite-ne-se-delivre-plus>; see also *infra* Section 4, "Violations of the Right to Freedom of Movement."

³ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁴ Interview I0017 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); see also Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); BERTELSMANN STIFTUNG'S TRANSFORMATION INDEX, BTI 2022 COUNTRY REPORT: CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC, 8 (2022), <https://bti-project.org/en/reports/country-report/CAF#pos3> [hereinafter BTI 2022 CAR REPORT] ("Even before the most recent crisis, those with Muslim names had difficulty getting birth certificates and state identity cards."); OFF. INT'L RELIGIOUS FREEDOM, U.S. DEP'T OF STATE, CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC 2021 INTERNATIONAL RELIGIOUS FREEDOM REPORT, 7 (2022), <https://www.state.gov/reports/2021-report-on-international-religious-freedom/central-african-republic/> [hereinafter CAR 2021 REPORT ON INTERNATIONAL RELIGIOUS FREEDOM] (noting that many Muslim children lacked birth certificates and that this allowed civil authorities to question their citizenship, resulting in many children being unable to attend school).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

1) Illegal and Discriminatory Requirements: Under CAR civil registration laws, the only document citizens need to present to access an identity card is their own birth certificate.⁵ However, Muslims are frequently required to provide extra documents, including parents' birth certificates.⁶ Many cannot meet these requirements, as their parents' documents may have never existed, or may have been destroyed or made inaccessible due to war, displacement, and poverty.⁷ One interviewee explained, “[they] ask us for our fathers’ birth certificates who [have been] killed and had all their belongings burnt.”⁸

In August 2023, CAR adopted a new constitution⁹ that changed the definition of a citizen by origin to “anyone whose parents are themselves of Central African origin.”¹⁰ This constitutional change risks making it even more onerous for Muslims to prove their nationality and obtain documents, as the law currently requires only one parent to be of Central African origin.¹¹ This is particularly concerning in light of Articles 11 and 12 of the new Constitution, which explicitly state that only Central African citizens may enjoy political rights or equality before the law.¹²

⁵ See WORLD BANK GRP., ID4D COUNTRY DIAGNOSTIC: CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC, 14–15 (2021) <https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/917381634623050532/id4d-country-diagnostic-central-african-republic> [hereinafter ID4D CAR DIAGNOSTIC] (noting that Law 60-164 and its two amendments prescribes the birth certificate as a required document for a CNI, which may only be issued in Bangui).

⁶ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0006 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0010 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0016 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); Interview I0024 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0025 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0028 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0030 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁷ Interview I0006 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0012 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0024 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0028 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁸ Interview I0006 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022).

⁹ CONSTITUTION DE LA REPUBLIQUE CENTRAFRICAINE, Aug. 2023; Carol Valade, *Centrafrique: l'Adoption d'une Nouvelle Constitution Consacre le 'Système Touadéra'*, LE MONDE (8 Aug. 2023), https://www.lemonde.fr/afrique/article/2023/08/08/centrafrique-l-adoption-d-une-nouvelle-constitution-consacre-le-systeme-touadera_6184838_3212.html.

¹⁰ CONSTITUTION DE LA REPUBLIQUE CENTRAFRICAINE, Aug. 2023, art. 10.

¹¹ LAW NO. 1961.212 OF APR. 20, 1961 STATING THE CENTRAL AFRICAN CODE OF NATIONALITY, art. 7; see also ID4D CAR DIAGNOSTIC, *supra* note 5, at 4 (noting that CAR's birth registration and nationality laws are among the strictest in Africa, even for individuals whose parents are both Central African).

¹² CONSTITUTION DE LA REPUBLIQUE CENTRAFRICAINE, arts. 11–12, Aug. 2023.

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

2) Harassment: When processing identity cards, civil servants subject Muslims to discriminatory and humiliating questioning about their identity that Christians do not face.¹³ Interviewees reported that public officials referred to them as foreigners, used derogatory terms, blamed Muslims for violence, and made offensive jokes.¹⁴ For example, one interviewee recalled an encounter with a police colonel who called her a “Nigerian foreigner” despite her being Central African.¹⁵ Sometimes civil servants falsely accuse Muslims of presenting forged documents.¹⁶

3) Corruption: Civil servants also subject Muslims to illegal demands for extra payments during the process of applying for national identity cards.¹⁷ One interviewee characterized the process as a negotiation rather than a right.¹⁸ Another described obtaining documents as “synonymous with the payment of hundreds of thousands of CFA francs.”¹⁹ These difficulties deter some Muslims from even attempting to obtain identity documents.²⁰

II. Violations of the Right to Education

The government of CAR is violating the right to education for the general population,²¹ and specifically for Muslim students. CAR violates the right to education against Muslims by: (1) discriminating against Muslims

¹³ Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0037 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

¹⁴ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); COMUC Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

¹⁵ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022).

¹⁶ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023); Interview I0037 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

¹⁷ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0006 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0009 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0010 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0016 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0024 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0030 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0031 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0032 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0034 with Muslim community member (25 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 March 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

¹⁸ Interview I0029 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022).

¹⁹ Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022).

²⁰ Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022).

²¹ In particular, the government has failed to provide adequate infrastructure and access to primary education. As of 2022, over 66% of children in CAR do not attend school. Armed groups have significantly damaged or occupied over 1000 schools. UNICEF, HUMANITARIAN ACTION FOR CHILDREN: CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC, 2 (Dec. 5, 2022), <https://www.unicef.org/media/131881/file/2023-HAC-CAR.pdf>. As for primary education, in many instances,

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

registering for school; (2) creating a discriminatory school environment for Muslim students; and (3) preventing Muslims from obtaining diplomas.

1) **Registration:** Many Muslim children do not have birth certificates due to discrimination they face in obtaining such documents, but are routinely asked to produce them when registering for school. As a result, they face obstacles in attending school.²²

2) **Discriminatory environment:** CAR further violates the right to education by not taking adequate steps to protect Muslim students from discriminatory treatment by teachers and other students.²³ Teachers and administrators insult Muslim students, ask them for money, and even steal their food.²⁴ One interviewee was told by his teacher that his “place [was] not on the school bench,” but instead “in the bush behind the sheep and the oxen.”²⁵ Muslim students in higher education endure similar discrimination.²⁶ University professors single out Muslims, often blaming them for the country’s underdevelopment.²⁷ An official told one interviewee that “higher education is not the domain of Muslims.”²⁸ Muslim students were also not provided with a space to pray in schools.²⁹

COMUC has documented that parents have to pay for uniforms, books, other school supplies, teacher salaries, and school upkeep. These problems are amplified for Muslim students, as teachers and administrators frequently ask them for bribes that they do not demand from Christian students. One interviewee told COMUC: “children have to pay money to the teachers for access to the classrooms.” Interview I0004 with a Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022).

²² CAR 2021 REPORT ON INTERNATIONAL RELIGIOUS FREEDOM, *supra* note 4, at 7; BTI 2022 CAR REPORT, *supra* note 4, at 8; COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #2 (28 Feb. 2023).

²³ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #2 (28 Feb. 2023).

²⁴ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023); Interview I0039 with Muslim community member (03 March 2023).

²⁵ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022).

²⁶ Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022).

²⁷ *Id.*

²⁸ *Id.*

²⁹ Interview I0003 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0012 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); Interview I0028 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0033 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

3) **Diplomas:** Muslims students also face discrimination in obtaining university and secondary school diplomas, as officials often hold their diplomas for months or demand bribes to release them.³⁰ One graduate reported waiting seven years to obtain their diploma.³¹ Not only are students required to pay for diplomas, but there is no formalized process for receiving them.³² Muslim students hear of these experiences of discrimination and harm from their peers, which then discourages them from enrolling in secondary school in the first place.³³

The findings above demonstrate how CAR violates the right to non-discrimination and the right to education. The government must ensure access to all levels of education is provided on a non-discriminatory basis and protect Muslim students' religious expression in educational settings.

III. Violations of the Right to Health

The entire population of CAR experiences a general failure of the healthcare system.³⁴ Muslims in CAR also experience significant discrimination in accessing healthcare. This section describes: (1) discriminatory treatment of Muslims in accessing healthcare and (2) harms experienced by Muslim women and girls.

³⁰ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0017 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0028 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0033 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

³¹ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022). The interviewee explained that school administrators often expected bribes in return for academic success, noting that “to pass the baccalaureate you must necessarily give money,” or else you would “automatically fail and without a[n] . . . appeal.” *Id.*

³² Interview I0017 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022).

³³ Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022).

³⁴ With only 20 public hospitals servicing the country and a shortage of hospital beds, the majority of CAR's population lives without “timely access to basic health services.” Compare Paul O. Ouma et al., *Access to Emergency Hospital Care Provided by the Public Sector in Sub-Saharan Africa in 2015: A Geocoded Inventory and Spatial Analysis*, 6 THE LANCET GLOBAL HEALTH 342, 344 (Mar. 2018), with U.N. OHCHR & WORLD HEALTH ORG. (WHO), FACT SHEET NO. 31: THE RIGHT TO HEALTH 4 (2008). Roughly half of CAR's population needs assistance to access basic services and goods essential for survival. UN OFFICE FOR THE COORDINATION OF HUMANITARIAN AFFAIRS, CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC: SITUATION REPORT (Nov. 30, 2021), <https://reliefweb.int/report/central-african-republic/central-african-republic-situation-report-30-november-2021>. In 2019, domestic health expenditure per capita was \$3.93 (just 4.84% of general government expenditure), ranking fourth lowest globally. WHO *Global Health Expenditure Database*, THE WORLD BANK, https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SH.XPD.GHED.GE.ZS?end=2019&most_recent_value_desc=false (Apr. 7, 2023) (showing that only South Sudan, the DRC, and Cameroon spent less per capita in 2019).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

1) Discrimination: Muslim Central Africans face discriminatory barriers in accessing healthcare, and civil servants charge them inflated prices for healthcare.³⁵ Muslim patients often have to pay bribes to access treatment, even in emergencies,³⁶ and also have to pay for tests and treatments that the State claims to provide for free.³⁷ One interviewee states that doctors “make [Muslims] pay for tests that every[one] knows are free, including HIV tests ... because [they] are part of the Muslim community.”³⁸ Another says that “if you have a Muslim name, you are directed to the pharmacy with an overpriced prescription.”³⁹ Additionally, interviewees experience their health concerns being ignored, trivialized, or negated in medical settings,⁴⁰ and reported that medical practitioners were hostile and used discriminatory language.⁴¹

³⁵ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0036 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022).

³⁶ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0003 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0006 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0010 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0011 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0016 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0030 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0031 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0036 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0037 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

³⁷ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0003 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #2 (28 Feb. 2023).

³⁸ Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022).

³⁹ Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022).

⁴⁰ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0006 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022).

⁴¹ Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #2 (28 Feb. 2023); Interview I0040 with Muslim community member (03 March 2023).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

2) Muslim women: Muslim women, especially pregnant women, described the discriminatory treatment they suffered, which exposes them to specific and heightened health risks.⁴² They receive poor treatment, their concerns are minimized, and they are subjected to verbal harassment. Sometimes Muslim women dress like non-Muslim women and remove their religious head-coverings to avoid being treated poorly, discriminated against, and extorted.⁴³ Discrimination and abuse can be so severe that pregnant Muslims sometimes feel that they cannot safely visit a hospital or access healthcare during childbirth.⁴⁴

The government of CAR fails to protect, respect, and fulfil the right to health, especially of Muslim citizens. The government must take steps to prevent discrimination toward Muslims in healthcare and ensure that overall access to the right to health is improved.

IV. Violations of the Right to Freedom of Movement

The CAR government violates, in a discriminatory manner, Muslims' freedom of movement. This section focuses on freedom of movement violations at government-run security checkpoints.⁴⁵ Abuses at these checkpoints are widespread, and Muslims are especially targeted. They face (1) corruption; (2) discriminatory treatment; and (3) abuse.

1) Corruption: State security forces demand bribes at checkpoints.⁴⁶ Security forces often demand bribes from all citizens, and particularly target Muslim Central Africans for extra extortion.⁴⁷ Interviewees explained that these practices “push[] the population to lose trust in the [security forces] at the checkpoints.”⁴⁸ Muslims

⁴² Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0021 with Muslim community member (Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #2 (28 Feb. 2023).

⁴³ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #2 (28 Feb. 2023).

⁴⁴ Interview I0040 with Muslim community member (03 March 2023); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #3 (1 Mar. 2023).

⁴⁵ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁴⁶ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023). *See also* INTERNATIONAL PEACE INFORMATION SERVICE & DANISH INSTITUTE FOR INTERNATIONAL STUDIES, CENTRAL AFRICAN REPUBLIC: A CONFLICT MAPPING 100 (2018), https://ipisresearch.be/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/1809-CAR-conflict-mapping_web.pdf. Additionally, because of the overall climate of insecurity, armed groups and criminals also set up illegal roadblocks for extortion, and it can be difficult for travelers to know who is running a particular informal stop. *Id.*

⁴⁷ For example, MINUSCA and OHCHR report that two CAR nationals employed by a humanitarian organization, one Christian and one Muslim, were stopped at a checkpoint. The Christian was told to pay 1,000 Central African Francs, while the Muslim was told to pay 5,000 Central African Francs. MINUSCA & UN OHCHR, RAPPORT PUBLIC SUR LES VIOLATIONS DES DROITS DE L'HOMME ET DU DROIT INTERNATIONAL HUMANITAIRE EN RÉPUBLIQUE CENTRAFRICAINE DURANT LA PÉRIODE ÉLECTORALE 25 (Aug. 4, 2021) [hereinafter MINUSCA & OHCHR 2021 Report], https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Countries/CF/report_abuses_violations_HR_InternationalHumanitarianLaw_Elections_CAR.pdf.

⁴⁸ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

are profiled and stereotyped as being wealthier, and are asked to pay higher bribes.⁴⁹ Interviewees recalled frequently being forced to pay bribes at checkpoints,⁵⁰ explaining, “if you are Muslim, you have to pay.”⁵¹ Another stated, “If you have a lot of money, you can travel . . . if you don’t, you are forced to stay in Bangui.”⁵² Not having a CNI increases the risk of extortion.⁵³

2) Discriminatory Treatment & Abuse: Muslim travelers at checkpoints face abuse and discriminatory treatment at the hands of security forces.⁵⁴ Interviewees explained, “[when] soldiers take the identity document of a Christian, they hand it back without question.”⁵⁵ Muslims, however, are often subjected to prolonged interrogations and harassment⁵⁶ and falsely accused of links to armed groups.⁵⁷ One individual stated that “we

⁴⁹ *Id.*

⁵⁰ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0003 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 March 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0010 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0012 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0014 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0017 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0025 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0029 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0034 with Muslim community member (25 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0037 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁵¹ Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022).

⁵² COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁵³ See Section 1, “Violations of the Right to Legal Recognition.” See also Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022) (interviewee described having issues at a checkpoint because he was carrying his passport); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0025 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0037 with Muslim community member (02 Mar. 2023).

⁵⁴ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0034 with Muslim community member (25 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0036 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022).

⁵⁵ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022). See also Interview I0012 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁵⁶ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022).

⁵⁷ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0014 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

are constantly assaulted by [groups] who kill us. As soon as you fall within their nets, whether trying to get around at night or during the day, it's over for you."⁵⁸

Muslim Central Africans face heightened violations of freedom of movement when traveling outside Bangui.⁵⁹ Interviewees explained that security forces at checkpoints will usually accept the national identity card; they will often not accept Central African passports, which some community members were able to obtain more easily.⁶⁰ Interviewees described being afraid to travel because of abuse and extortion at checkpoints.⁶¹

For example, interviewees described abuses at numerous checkpoints on the route from Bangui to the livestock market at Bouboui, where the vast majority of livestock traders are Muslim.⁶² They explained that to travel to the market they are required to register and deposit their CNI with the authorities before leaving Bangui, leaving them vulnerable to abuse while traveling.⁶³

Restrictions on freedom of movement are also especially acute for the majority-Muslim Peuhl (also known as Fulani) community, both because large parts of the Peuhl population are nomadic and semi-nomadic, and because the Peuhl have been particularly stigmatized in the armed conflict.⁶⁴ Interviewees described

⁵⁸ Interview I0030 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022).

⁵⁹ Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0010 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023). *See also* WORLD REPORT 2023, HUM. RTS. WATCH 132 (2023), https://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/media_2023/01/World_Report_2023_WEBSPREADS_0.pdf (noting generally that “road checkpoints make || travel difficult outside the capital, Bangui”).

⁶⁰ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁶¹ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0003 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0006 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0011 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0030 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁶² Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023). *See also*, Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022). The livestock market at Bouboui was inaugurated in January 2020 and media reports suggest that almost all of the livestock traders at the market are Muslim. *Inauguration du Nouveau Marché à Bétail à Bouboui Située à 45 km de Bangui*, RJDH-CENTRAFRIQUE (Jan. 16, 2020), <https://www.rjdhrca.org/centrafrique-inauguration-du-nouveau-marche-a-betail-a-bouboui-situee-a-45-km-de-bangui/>.

⁶³ Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁶⁴ Thierry Vircoulon, *Les Peuls Mbororo dans le Conflit Centrafricain*, INSTITUT FRANÇAIS DES RELATIONS INTERNATIONALES 32 (Apr. 13, 2021), <https://www.ifri.org/fr/publications/etudes-de-lifri/peuls-mbororo-conflit-centrafricain> (“If anti-Peuhl sentiment pre-existed the conflict, the latter increased it manyfold.”).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

discrimination against Peuhl citizens at checkpoints.⁶⁵ “If you are Peuhl and they ask you for documents at checkpoints and you don’t have them, they will automatically assume you are from an armed group,” one said.⁶⁶

V. Violations of the Rights to Life, Liberty, and Security

Arbitrary detention, abuse, and extrajudicial killings of Muslim Central Africans remain prevalent.⁶⁷ Such violence is rarely investigated.⁶⁸ In the final quarter of 2022 alone, the UN Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) documented 1,300 incidents of illegal arrests and detentions, ill-treatment, torture, and extrajudicial killings against CAR’s civilian population. OHCHR highlighted that “state forces and their allies committed 58% of these violations” and “specifically target the Fulani and Muslim communities.”⁶⁹ Government security forces unlawfully subject Muslims to ethnic and religious profiling and

⁶⁵ Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0005 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022).

⁶⁶ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁶⁷ Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0032 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023). *See also* R. of the Sec’y Gen. of the U.N. Sec. Council on Cent. Afr. Rep., S/2023/108, at 9-11 (2023) [hereinafter U.N. Security Council Report S/2023/108]; *Central African Republic: UN Report Calls for Urgent End to Mounting Human Rights Abuses & Violations*, OHCHR (Aug. 4, 2021), <https://www.ohchr.org/en/2021/08/central-african-republic-un-report-calls-urgent-end-mounting-human-rights-abuses-and#:~:text=Among%20the%20documented%20abuses%20and,by%20parties%20to%20the%20conflict> [hereinafter OHCHR Aug. 2021 Press Release].

⁶⁸ Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0022 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0028 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022). *See also One Step Forward, Two Steps Backwards: Justice in The Central African Republic*, AMNESTY INT’L 2 (Dec. 8, 2021) <https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/afr19/5038/2021/en/> [hereinafter Amnesty International 2021 Report]; Yao Agbetse, *Report on the Independent Expert on the Situation of Human Rights in the Central African Republic*, A/HRC/51/59, U.N. HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL, (Aug. 22, 2022), <https://reliefweb.int/report/central-african-republic/human-rights-situation-central-african-republic-report-independent-expert-situation-human-rights-central-african-republic-yao-agbetse-ahrc5159> [hereinafter Yao Agbetse Report A/HRC/51/59].

⁶⁹ *Central African Republic: Atrocities must end, says Volker Türk*, OHCHR (Mar. 31, 2023) <https://www.ohchr.org/en/speeches/2023/03/central-african-republic-atrocities-must-end-says-volker-turk> [hereinafter Volker Türk Statement March 2023]. *See also* U.N. Security Council Report S/2023/108, *supra* note 67, at 9. (“MINUSCA documented a resurgence of cases of arbitrary arrests and detentions linked to search and military operations by national defense and security forces conducted in areas primarily populated by Fulani and Muslim communities.”); U.N. OHCHR, Bachelet Updates the Human Rights Council on the Central African Republic (Mar. 30, 2022), <https://www.ohchr.org/en/statements/2022/03/bachelet-updates-human-rights-council-central-african-republic>.

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

accuse them without basis of being members of or accomplices to armed groups.⁷⁰ This profiling has re-intensified since the government declared a state of emergency in January 2021,⁷¹ allowing for increased military and police operations.⁷² In their 2021 report on conditions in CAR, the OHCHR and the U.N. Multidimensional Integrated Stabilization Mission in the Central African Republic (MINUSCA) explain:

*These exceptional measures which are accompanied by restrictions on liberty and concentration of power by the authorities, have led to violations and abuse of international human rights law and international humanitarian law by the FACA, the [internal security forces (FSI)], and other security personnel, notably including abuse of power and police violence, and targeting of certain communities (Muslims and Peuhl)*⁷³

In the 2018 UPR, CAR accepted recommendations by other states to “[t]ake all appropriate measures to prevent abuse, torture and other degrading treatment committed by the security forces.”⁷⁴ However, community members report a surge in arbitrary detentions, arrests, and related abuses since the 2018 UPR.⁷⁵ The UN Secretary General also reports that between October 2022 and February 2023, “MINUSCA documented 145 cases of arbitrary arrest and detention affecting 763 victims, the Fulani community being the most affected.”⁷⁶

⁷⁰ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022). *See also* Volker Türk Statement March 2023, *supra* note 69; OHCHR Aug. 2021 Press Release, *supra* note 67 (reporting the deliberate targeting of Muslims over their alleged affiliation with armed groups was continuing); Central African Republic: UN Reports Detail Serious Violations, Some Possibly Amounting to War Crimes and Crimes Against Humanity, OHCHR, (Jul. 25, 2022), <https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2022/07/central-african-republic-un-reports-detail-serious-violations-some-possibly> (documenting one example of such targeting).

⁷¹ The State of Emergency was initially declared on January 21, 2021 and has subsequently been extended. The State of Emergency was declared after the Coalition of Patriots for Change (CPC), a coalition of six rebel groups, attempted a coup in December 2020. The coup attempt was blocked by state security forces, their allies, and MINUSCA. *Central African Republic Extends State of Emergency For 6 Months*, REUTERS (Feb. 5, 2021), <https://www.reuters.com/article/uk-centralafrica-security/central-african-republic-extends-state-of-emergency-for-6-months-idUSKBN2A51V6>; Amnesty International 2021 Report, *supra* note 68, at 3–4.

⁷² Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023). *See also* MINUSCA & OHCHR 2021 Report, *supra* note 47, at 10; OHCHR Aug. 2021 Press Release, *supra* note 67 (The MINUSCA Human Rights Division “confirmed an increase in attacks on members of the Muslim community by the FACA, FSI and other security personnel.”); Amnesty International 2021 Report, *supra* note 68, at 2, 3–4.

⁷³ MINUSCA & OHCHR 2021 Report, *supra* note 47, at 10.

⁷⁴ Rep. of the Hum. Rts. Council Working Grp. on the Universal Periodic Rev., U.N. Doc A/HRC/40/12, at 11 (2019).

⁷⁵ Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0032 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁷⁶ U.N. Security Council Report S/2023/108, *supra* note 67, at 10; R of the Sec’y Gen. of the U.N. Sec. Council on Cent. Afr. Rep., S/2022/762, at 11 (2022) (finding that in the period of June 2, 2022 and October 1, 2022, “targeted arrests and torture disproportionately affected specific communities, such as the Fulani”); U.N. OHCHR, Bachelet Updates the Human Rights Council on the Central African Republic, *supra* note 69 (“I am concerned that the Government’s

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

Community interviews corroborated UN findings that state security forces target Peuhl and Muslim citizens,⁷⁷ describing patterns of arbitrary detention and abuse. Interviewees explained that their Muslim loved ones, friends, and acquaintances were detained by security forces, often after being falsely accused of having connections with rebels.⁷⁸ They perceive that these accusations were based solely on the victim being Muslim, and often Peuhl.⁷⁹ Detentions frequently occurred at checkpoints.⁸⁰ Because Muslims face discrimination in obtaining a national identity card,⁸¹ they are disproportionately likely to be detained. Security forces sometimes incorrectly assume that a person carrying a lot of cash has connections to rebel groups.⁸² In two cases, innocent individuals were detained on this basis, but they were simply going to make money transfers as part of regular business activity.⁸³ Additionally, security forces sometimes used discriminatory language and slurs during arrests and detentions.⁸⁴ Individuals were frequently arrested without a warrant or reasonable basis.⁸⁵

response to armed groups increasingly involves arbitrary arrests of members of already vulnerable communities, such as Muslims and Peuls, whom they associate with armed groups.”).

⁷⁷ Compare Volker Türk Statement March 2023, *supra* note 69 with Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0020 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁷⁸ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁷⁹ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁸⁰ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0002 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0035 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁸¹ See *supra* text accompanying notes 2-64.

⁸² Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022).

⁸³ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022).

⁸⁴ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁸⁵ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

Detentions for failure to present documents can range from days to weeks and even months if the individual is accused of links to rebel groups,⁸⁶ with individuals sometimes released only after their family members paid a bribe.⁸⁷ Some detainees were held at military sites.⁸⁸ Frequently, detainees were not presented before a judge, and some were held for extended periods without trial.⁸⁹ Interviewees recalled difficulties visiting detainees,⁹⁰ including that visitors were sometimes interrogated or detained themselves.⁹¹ Detainees experience harsh treatment, abuse, and torture.⁹² Those who are eventually released can face increased suspicion and be subjected to further identity document questioning and arrest.⁹³

community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0032 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023). See U.N. OHCHR, Bachelet Updates the Human Rights Council on the Central African Republic, *supra* note 69.

⁸⁶ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁸⁷ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023).

⁸⁸ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁸⁹ Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0027 with Muslim community member (20 Mar. 2022); Interview I0032 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023). This is part of a broader crisis of failing to present detainees before a judge and extended pre-trial detention in CAR. *News Release: Central African Republic, UN Independent Expert, OHCHR* (Feb. 17, 2023)[hereinafter *News Release: Central African Republic*] (finding that “[t]he failure to respect the time limits for police custody must be corrected”); Amnesty International 2021 Report, *supra* note 68, at 12 (“Hundreds of individuals are held in pre-trial detention over time limits set by the law, and sometimes for several years, waiting for their day in court. The Bangui detention centers (Camp de Roux, Bimbo and Ngaragba) are overcrowded.”).

⁹⁰ Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Mar. Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁹¹ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #1 (27 Feb. 2023); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁹² Interview I0001 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0004 with Muslim community member (19 Mar. 2022); Interview I0013 with Muslim community member (22 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023). MINUSCA and OHCHR have also documented abuses of power, police violence, excessive use of force, and torture against Muslim and Peuhl (Fulani) communities. MINUSCA & OHCHR 2021 Report, *supra* note 47, at 10, 18.

⁹³ Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

Response to Call for Input: Advocacy of Hatred Based on Religion or Belief - Transformative Responses

In some cases, interviewees reported that their Muslim loved ones, friends, or acquaintances were killed by security forces.⁹⁴ Muslims were executed at the place of their arrest, during transfers, or during detention.⁹⁵ Often the State fails to provide information on individuals detained or killed, and their fate is known only due to testimony from other prisoners or search efforts by family and community members.⁹⁶

The CAR government has also failed to meet its obligation to undertake meaningful investigations into unlawful killings of Muslim citizens.⁹⁷ Family, community members, and human rights defenders who attempt to document abuses and file reports risk being arrested, tortured or killed for speaking out.⁹⁸ When community members file reports despite this risk, there is frequently no response from law enforcement.⁹⁹ Security forces often operate with impunity in the absence of a functioning judicial system and meaningful investigations.¹⁰⁰

⁹⁴ Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0022 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0028 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023); MINUSCA & OHCHR have also reported on extrajudicial killings of Muslim and Peuhl individuals. MINUSCA & OHCHR 2021 Report, *supra* note 47, at 16, 18.

⁹⁵ Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁹⁶ Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁹⁷ Interview I0007 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0008 with Muslim community member (24 Mar. 2022); Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0022 with Muslim community member (23 Mar. 2022); Interview I0028 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022). *See News Release: Central African Republic* *supra* note 89; Amnesty International 2021 Report, *supra* note 68, at 2; Yao Agbetse, *Report on the Independent Expert on the Situation of Human Rights in the Central African Republic*, A/HRC/51/59, U.N. HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL, (Aug. 22, 2022), <https://reliefweb.int/report/central-african-republic/human-rights-situation-central-african-republic-report-independent-expert-situation-human-rights-central-african-republic-yao-agbetse-ahrc5159>.

⁹⁸ COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #3 (1 Mar. 2023); Interview I0017 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); Interview I0041 with Muslim community member (02 March 2023).

⁹⁹ Interview I0015 with Muslim community member (21 Mar. 2022); COMUC Community Research Workshop, Day #2 (28 Feb. 2023).

¹⁰⁰ Volker Türk Statement March 2023, *supra* note 69; Human Rights Watch, *Central African Republic: Abuses by Russia-Linked Forces* (May 3, 2022), <https://www.hrw.org/news/2022/05/03/central-african-republic-abuses-russia-linked-forces>; Amnesty International 2021 Report, *supra* note 68, at 5, 11–13 (“Very few individuals suspected of criminal responsibility for war crimes or crimes against humanity in CAR have been arrested, prosecuted, or tried to date.”); U.N. OHCHR, Bachelet Updates the Human Rights Council on the Central African Republic, *supra* note 69 (“[I]mpunity for serious human rights violations and other crimes is at the heart of the violence in the Central African Republic.”).

In response to question 14 of the call for input, COMUC makes the following recommendations:

Anti-Discrimination and Legal Recognition

1. Encourage countries like the Central African Republic to adopt legislation recognizing Muslims or other religious minority groups as legal minorities.
2. Ensure adequate protection and representation of Muslims and other religious minorities within all branches of government.
3. Collaborate with country leaders to pledge to reduce discrimination. Establish commissions in relevant countries to investigate issues of religious discrimination and make recommendations.
4. Ensure that nationality and citizenship laws, as well as the process for obtaining identity cards or other official documents, do not unduly burden or discriminate against Muslims or other religious minorities.

Life, Liberty, and Security

5. Put an end to arbitrary arrests and detentions, torture, disappearances, and extrajudicial killings committed by state security forces.
6. End targeted practices of arbitrary arrest and detention of Muslims or other religious minorities.
7. Effectively investigate and prosecute all allegations of religious-based unlawful killings, arbitrary detentions, and torture, in accordance with international legal standards and best practices.

Education

8. End discriminatory treatment of Muslims and other religious minorities in educational institutions. Requiring anti-discrimination training to ensure that students from religious minorities are treated with respect and dignity at all levels of education.
9. Rehabilitate the infrastructure of schools destroyed in conflicts such as the recent civil war in CAR, and train new teachers to ensure schools are accessible to all students regardless of religion or belief.

Freedom of Movement

10. Ensure that Muslims and other religious minority groups are able to move freely within their countries, including through road checkpoints, by demanding an increase in government oversight of checkpoints and sanctioning the demand for bribes.

Healthcare

11. Improve healthcare services for the Muslim population and prevent discrimination against Muslim patients in CAR. Adopt similar policies in countries where religious minorities are denied their right to health.
12. Improve healthcare services for women, including Muslim women, by training more nurses and Obstetrician-gynecologists on anti-discrimination practices and increasing the number of maternal care clinics accessible to Muslim women in CAR.