



**ПОСТОЯННОЕ ПРЕДСТАВИТЕЛЬСТВО
РОССИЙСКОЙ ФЕДЕРАЦИИ
ПРИ ОТДЕЛЕНИИ ООН И ДРУГИХ
МЕЖДУНАРОДНЫХ ОРГАНИЗАЦИЯХ
В ЖЕНЕВЕ**

PERMANENT MISSION
OF THE RUSSIAN FEDERATION
TO THE UNITED NATIONS OFFICE AND
OTHER INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS
IN GENEVA

№ 2288

Постоянное представительство Российской Федерации при Отделении ООН и других международных организациях в Женеве свидетельствует свое уважение Управлению Верховного комиссара ООН по правам человека и в ответ на его запрос от 10 мая 2024 года имеет честь препроводить комментарии и предложения Российской Федерации к проекту плана действий для Пятого этапа Всемирной программы образования в области прав человека (2025-2029 годы).

Постоянное представительство Российской Федерации пользуется случаем, чтобы возобновить Управлению уверения в своем весьма высоком уважении. *CB*

Приложение: упомянутое, на 47 лл.

Женева, «*12*» июня 2024 года



УПРАВЛЕНИЕ ВЕРХОВНОГО
КОМИССАРА ООН
ПО ПРАВАМ ЧЕЛОВЕКА

Женева

Proposed Plan of action for the fifth phase (2025-2029) of the World Programme for Human Rights Education

Paragraph 1

Change words «expressed consensus» to «expressed an importance of» (as there is no consensus of the international community on the issue), change «human rights education» to «education aimed at strengthening respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms (human rights education)» (as it is in the HRC res. 54/7). Delete words «and its contribution to the prevention of violence and conflicts» (it is not relevant).

Paragraph 2

In the first sentence change words «Provisions on human rights education have been incorporated into many international instruments and documents» to «Human rights education shall be based on the principles reflected into many international instruments and documents».

The mentioning of the Convention on the Rights of the Child is not relevant. The youth could be considered after 14 y.o.

Paragraph 4

Delete words «In accordance with the above instruments, which contain elements of a definition of human rights education agreed upon by the international community» as in the mentioned instruments there is no definition of human rights education. Change «includes any» to «may include» as human rights education may

include other elements. Delete words «aimed at building a universal culture of human rights», as the definition is not consensus.

Paragraph 5 (a)

Delete the word «lifelong» as it is unclear why it is a lifelong process.

Paragraph 5 (c)

Delete words «behaviour: taking action to defend and» as it is unclear what does it mean.

Paragraph 9 (a)

Change words «To promote the development of a culture of human rights» to «Promotion of human rights».

Paragraph 9 (b)

Change «its harmonization in national policies» to «in accordance with national policies» as any education programmes are based on national educational programmes.

Paragraph 9 (c)

Delete words «and international levels» as it is unclear what does it mean.

Paragraph 9 (g)

Delete 9 (g) as it is unclear where to implement the mentioned documents, taking into account that UNESCO document is only a recommendation.

Paragraph 10 (a)

Delete «the inalienability» as according to the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action «all human rights are universal, indivisible, interdependent and interrelated».

Paragraph 10 (a)

Change words «and appreciation of diversity» to «human rights», delete words «sexual orientation and gender identity, and other bases» as it is in contrary of legislation of many states and could be interpreted broadly.

Paragraph 10 (c)

Delete words «and environmental fields» as it is a controversial concept.

Delete a word «violent» as non-violent conflicts are not existed.

Paragraph 10 (c)

Delete words «to identify their human rights entitlements and to claim them effectively» as it is unclear what does it mean.

Paragraph 10 (d)

The whole para should be deleted as empowering communities and individuals

is too general.

Paragraph 10 (e)

Delete words «respect, protect and fulfil the promote and protect».

Paragraph 10 (f)

After words «take into account historical» add «religious» as religious factor is not mentioned.

Paragraph 10 (h)

Delete words «and contexts».

Part II.

In the title of part II and in all other parts of the proposed Plan delete all mentions of children as according to paragraph 3 of the HRC res. 54/7 «..the fifth phase of the World Programme will continue to focus on youth»... At the same time it will be in line with paragraph 13 that is about «focusing on human rights education for youth».

Paragraph 11

After words «In its resolution 54/7, the Human Rights Council requested the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) to prepare a plan of action for the fifth phase (2025-2029) of the World Programme,

devoted to children and youth» add «while expanding to include children as priority sectors» (Op3 A/HRC/RES/54/7).

Paragraph 13

After words «and the fourth phase» add «focusing on human rights education for youth».

Paragraph 16

Change the para to the following:

«Beyond age, youth is fluid and non-homogeneous category, made up of individuals with evolving capacities. They represent transitory periods of life, which differ according to different sociocultural settings».

Paragraph 16

Add the following words to the para «Moreover, the role of parents or legal guardians is of paramount importance in providing appropriate direction».

Paragraph 18-19

Delete as not relevant to the Programme.

Paragraph 21

Delete words «In his Plan of Action to Prevent Violent Extremism, the Secretary-General encouraged "teaching respect for human rights and diversity, fostering critical thinking, promoting media and digital literacy, and developing the behavioural and socioemotional skills that can contribute to peaceful coexistence and tolerance" as elements of related national plans of action» as the Plan is not a consensus document.

Paragraph 23

Add words «as appropriate» after «such as ensuring their participation at the local, national and international levels» and words «young women» after «young people worldwide».

Delete words «to this end, the Committee of the Rights of the Child recommended States to transform education and build the digital literacy and skills of children and youth in all formal, non- formal and informal contexts» as General Comments are to be considered as only a private opinion of a group of experts. Delete words «Around 2.2 billion - or two thirds of - children and» and «girls and» as it is not relevant.

Paragraph 24

Delete words «and girls».

Delete words «Convention on the Rights of the Child states that "the education of the child shall be directed to (...) the development of respect for the natural environment"» and «In its General Comment No. 26 (2023), the Committee on the Rights of the Child recognized that to ensure their free, active, meaningful and effective participation, children should be provided with

environmental and human rights education, age-appropriate and accessible information, adequate time and resources and a supportive and enabling environment» as not relevant.

Paragraph 25

Delete the following words «The Committee on the Rights of the Child and the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW) stated that for girls and women to overcome social exclusion and poverty, which increase their vulnerability to exploitation, harmful practices and other forms of gender-based violence, they need to be equipped with the skills and competencies necessary to assert their rights; the two Committees recommended that States include in the educational curriculum information on human rights, including those of women and children, gender equality and selfawareness and contribute to eliminating gender stereotypes and fostering an environment of non-discrimination» as a General Comment.

Delete words «International human rights experts also recommended that States develop educational programmes to eliminate prejudicial or discriminatory attitudes or behaviours with regard to any sexual orientation, gender identity or gender expression» as it is unclear what does it mean and as it is only a private opinion not consistent with legislation of many states.

Paragraph 26 (b)

Delete words «To expand human rights education for children and youth in formal and non-formal education and informal learning, prioritizing those in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» as a controversial concept.

Paragraph 29 (a)

Delete words «primary, secondary» as not relevant.

Paragraph 29 (d)

Change words «Developing and adopting relevant, explicit and comprehensive, including mechanisms, responsibilities and adequate financing and resources, and involving all stakeholders to ensure, coherence, monitoring, reporting and accountability» to «Developing and adopting relevant, explicit and comprehensive policy implementation and evaluation measures, including mechanisms, responsibilities and adequate financing and resources, and involving all relevant stakeholders to ensure, as appropriate, coherence, monitoring, reporting and accountability».

Paragraph 29 (iv)

Delete «and revising inconsistent legislation» as it is only up to the states to decide.

Paragraph 29 (vi)

Change to the following: «Promoting an approach, based on international human rights law, to the whole educational establishments - from governance, management, discipline procedures, inclusion policies to other relevant regulations and practices».

Paragraph 29 (viii)

Delete words «particularly those in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» as it is unclear.

Paragraph 29 (c)

Change to the following «Ensuring coherence, links and synergies among related State and provincial policies, strategies and plans of action, including in the following areas: human rights education; youth; education; human rights, including the rights of those in vulnerable situations; digital technologies; environment and climate change; global citizenship; peace, security and the prevention of violent extremism, violence and conflict; crime prevention and criminal justice and the fight against corruption; sustainable development, in the context of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development and other development frameworks; combating racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance; etc.».

Paragraph 29 (d)

Change to the following: «Developing and adopting relevant, explicit and comprehensive policy implementation and evaluation measures, including

mechanisms, responsibilities and adequate financing and resources, and involving all relevant stakeholders to ensure, as appropriate, coherence, monitoring, reporting and accountability».

Paragraph 31

Delete words «including sexual content» and «including on sexual and reproductive health issues and human rights, hate speech, harmful content including gender-stereotyped», «quasi-judicial and non-judicial mechanisms» and «Sense of shared responsibility for a healthy planet and for respecting the needs and rights of each other, of other living beings and of nature itself».

Paragraph 31 (a) (i)

Change words «The possible adverse consequences of exposure to risks relating to content (including sexual content), contact, conduct and contract, including cyberaggression, trafficking, sexual exploitation and abuse and other forms of violence» to « The possible adverse consequences of exposure to risks relating to content, contact, conduct and contract, including aggression in digital space, trafficking, sexual exploitation and abuse and other forms of violence».

Paragraph 31 (i)

Change the appropriate paragraph to the following «The possible adverse consequences of exposure to risks relating to content, contact, conduct and contract, including aggression in digital space, trafficking, sexual exploitation and abuse and

other forms of violence» to «The possible adverse consequences of exposure to risks relating to content, contact, conduct and contract, including aggression in digital space, trafficking, sexual exploitation and abuse and other forms of violence».

Change «in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» to «in vulnerable situations» as all LGBT references must be deleted and intergovernmentally agreed terminology should be used.

Paragraphs 31 (b)(i)

Delete the following words «The principle of intergenerational equity, justice and solidarity and the interests of future generations whereby while the rights of children and young people who are present on Earth require immediate urgent attention, the children constantly arriving are also entitled to the realization of their human rights to the maximum extent».

Change an appropriate para to the following «The intersectional and differential effects of environment-related harm on certain groups of youth, especially young women, those belonging to Indigenous Peoples and national or ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities, those with disabilities and those living in disaster-prone or climate-vulnerable environments».

Change an appropriate para to the following «The link between the right to a clean, healthy and sustainable environment and other rights, such as the right to life, the right to the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health, the right to adequate standard of living and the right to education».

Paragraphs 31 (b)(ii)

Delete the following words: «Sense of shared responsibility for a healthy planet and for respecting the needs and rights of each other, of other living beings and of nature itself».

Paragraphs 31 (c)(i)

Delete words «and people of diverse gender identities» and «including distinction based on sex, sexual orientation and gender identity».

Delete words «sexual orientation and gender identity, including gender-based violence, violations of sexual and reproductive health and rights, child and forced marriage».

Delete words «sex- and» and «linked stereotypical roles stereotypes».

Delete words «The interaction and intersectionality of gender with other characteristics such as age, ethnicity, wealth, status, ability, geographical location, and sexual orientation. The right of every woman, girl, man, boy and person of diverse gender identities to make autonomous decisions about their own bodies and reproductive functions which is at the core of their basic rights to equality, privacy, and bodily integrity».

Delete words «and people of diverse gender identities».

Paragraphs 31 (c)(ii)

Delete words «Challenge patriarchal and heteronormative ideologies and structures that limit girls and women from freely and fully exercising and enjoying their human rights and uphold diversity and inclusion».

Delete words «and evidence-based» and «gender relations and responsible sexual behavior», «girls and» , «boys and»

Delete words «Realize their health, well-being and dignity and develop respectful social and age-appropriate sexual relationships».

Delete words «sexual and reproductive» and «including verbal and emotional abuse, stalking, sexual harassment and sexual violence, physical violence and exploitation».

Paragraphs 31 (c)(iii)

Change «inequalityies» to «inequality».

Delete words «boys and».

Delete words «and respect for diversity in gender identity and».

Delete words «Empathy towards the perceptions and lived experiences of those who experienced discrimination based on sex, sexual orientation and gender identity».

Paragraph 32

Change the paragraph to the following «Appropriate **methodologies** for human rights education for youth should be designed with them as key partners, be learner-centred, participatory, gender-sensitive, age-appropriate, transformative and inclusive. They should highlight experiential learning to enable young people to apply their knowledge about human rights principles to their lives, context and experiences, and peer-to-peer learning to allow for emotional connections, dialogue and understanding among themselves. Intergenerational and intercultural dialogue that strengthen solidarity between generations and cultures should accompany these educational efforts. Varied educational methods and settings, such as sports and outdoor learning,

films and documentaries, arts, cultures, games and storytelling, can collaboratively engage learners of all backgrounds». We strongly believe that gender-sensitive terminology is more than enough.

Paragraph 33 (b)

Change «traditional gender stereotypes that reproduce and reinforce gender-based discrimination against girls and women» to «gender stereotypes that reproduce and reinforce discrimination against women».

Paragraph 33 (i)

Change «in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» to «in vulnerable situations» as all LGBT references must be deleted and intergovernmentally agreed terminology should be used.

Paragraph 35

Delete words «particularly children» as not relevant.

Change words «educators from groups in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» to «those educators that are in vulnerable situations».

Paragraph 36 (d)

Delete words «and gender sensitivity and the impact of gendered behaviours on teaching and learning processes».

Paragraph 36 (e)

Delete words «taking into account the diversity of learners».

Paragraph 36 (f)

Delete words «responsive and transformative».

Paragraph 36 (g) and 36 (p)

Delete as not relevant.

Paragraph 36 (l)

Delete words «including assumptions and stereotypes about gender (conscious or subconscious)».

Paragraph 36 (q)

In order to keep the idea broader and more relevant to young people delete words «especially during the critical neurological growth spurts of early childhood and adolescence».

Paragraph 39

In order to have a clearer meaning delete words «human rights- based» and add «that promotes and protects human rights» after words «learning environment».

Paragraph 40

Change «the gender» to «between women and men», change «children and youth» to «young people».

Add words «appropriate and» after «environment in ways that are».

Delete words «in line with the best interests of the child. Specific measures to ensure protection of personal and sensitive data of both the learners and educators, and protection of children and youth from online violence, including cyberbullying and sexual and gender-based violence, are also required. Digital service providers must actively engage with children and youth, applying a child- and youth-rights and accessibility approach as well as appropriate safeguards, and give due consideration to their views when developing products and services. States must also ensure that no restrictions are placed on the exercise by children and youth of their human rights, including to freedom of expression, association and peaceful assembly, in the digital environment, other than those that are lawful, necessary and proportionate» as not relevant.

Paragraph 41

Delete words «from early childhood education through to secondary and tertiary education - and through different phases of an emergency, with particular regard to children and youth in situations of exclusion or vulnerability.

Environmentally friendly school facilities, such as those with lighting and heating sourced from renewable energy and edible gardens, can benefit learners» as not relevant.

Paragraph 42

Delete as inappropriate according to the national legislation of many states.

The other option is to change the paragraph to the following:

«With regard to **gender equality**, the creation of an educational environment in which young people are treated equally and encouraged to achieve their full potential, contributes to the elimination of discrimination against women. Education must be accessible, in both law and practice, to all women, men, girls and boys. Appropriate conditions shall be created for their right to education to be fully and freely enjoyed and exercised. This includes providing access to educational institutions that is within safe reach for all young people, either by ensuring that they are accessible at some reasonably convenient geographical location or through technological means. Proximity to schools, in particular in rural areas, is crucial, given the risk that they face when travelling to and from school. Essential consideration must be given to providing adequate infrastructure in educational institutions. Ensuring the rights of all young people within education extends beyond numerical equality. States must also take measures to curtail violence against all young people, including designating a mechanism for preventing, reporting and investigating incidents of violence in educational institutions and providing adequate public funding to address the problem.

Paragraph 44

Delete words «and with children and youth representatives as essential participants».

Change «reflect the diversity of the children and» to «take into account the needs of all».

Change «including those in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» to «including those in vulnerable situations» as all LGBT references must be deleted and intergovernmentally agreed terminology should be used.

Paragraph 45 (c)

Delete words «including young human rights defenders and those representing children and youth in situations of exclusion or vulnerability».

Paragraph 45 (d)

Delete words «peace, sustainable development, protection in humanitarian crisis». Only the areas relevant to the topic should be mentioned here.

Paragraph 45 (e)

Delete words «primary, secondary».

Paragraph 46

Change «and a minority groups» to «and national or ethnic, religious and linguistic minorities». In order to avoid LGBT propaganda, only the types of minorities, that are internationally recognized, should be listed.

Paragraph 47

Add words «upon the request of the Member State» after «in the meetings of the coordinating body».

Paragraph 48

Delete words «the universal periodic review, and to other international or regional intergovernmental bodies, such as the reporting mechanism under the UNESCO Recommendation on Education for Peace, Human Rights and Sustainable Development and the review mechanism of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, to ensure that progress in human rights education under this plan of action is included in those reports. It should also liaise with OHCHR and share information on national progress» as controversial. Before words «international or regional intergovernmental bodies» add a word «relevant».

Paragraph 49

Delete words «and gender mainstreaming approaches».

Paragraph 50

Delete as a controversial concept.

Step 1.

Delete words «children and» in the title.

Paragraph 51 (iii)

Delete words «primary, secondary».

Paragraph 51 (v)

Delete words «useful child- and».

Paragraph 51 (vii)

Delete words «education for sustainable development, peace education, global education, citizenship education».

Paragraph 52 (a)

Change words «in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» to «in vulnerable situations» as all LGBT references must be deleted and only intergovernmentally agreed terminology must be used.

Paragraph 53 (b)

Change words «in situations of exclusion or vulnerability» to «in vulnerable situations» as all LGBT references must be deleted and only intergovernmentally agreed terminology must be used.

Paragraph 56 (c)

Delete words «in situations of exclusion or vulnerability». All LGBT references must be deleted and only intergovernmentally agreed terminology must be used.

Paragraph 58

Change words «States will submit a midterm national progress report in» to «States may submit a midterm national progress report in» as it should be absolutely voluntary.

Paragraph 59

Delete. It is up to the states to decide what implement to the national strategy.

Paragraph 60

In the first sentence after words «United Nations human rights mechanisms, within their specific mandates, can support» add «upon request of the concerned state».

Change words «for children and youth should be regularly reviewed in the context of the universal periodic review» for «could be» as it is a possibility for states and not an obligation.

Paragraph 61

In the first sentence after words «International cooperation and assistance may be provided» add «upon request of the concerned state».

Paragraph 61 (e)

Delete words «primary, secondary» as irrelevant.

Paragraph 63

In the first sentence after words «The above-mentioned organizations and institutions» add «upon request of the concerned state».

Paragraph 63 (b) and 63 (g)

Delete words «primary, secondary» as irrelevant.