



**State of Israel  
Ministry of Justice**

**Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)**

**Government of Israel Reply to the Midterm Progress  
Report on the Implementation of the Third Phase of  
the World Program for Human Rights Education**

**February 2017**

## Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)

Further to your letter dated January 30, 2017, hereinafter is Israel's response to your questions.

We hope you will find this information useful.

### **Question no. 1**

#### **GOI Reply:**

1. **Human Rights Education** - In recent years, the Ministry of Education has created several educational programs on the topics of democracy, tolerance, coexistence, and human rights, which are intended, *inter alia*, to provide knowledge and tools in these fields and combat all forms of discrimination. In addition, the education system approaches the concept of preventing hate crimes and propaganda from a broad perspective, emphasizing tolerance, pluralism, prevention of racism, and personal attitudes toward foreigners and "others." These concepts are part of special educational programs designed for school pupils of all ages and aimed at exposing them to different groups within Israeli society. In addition, the pupils learn about these principles of democracy, the rule of law, human rights, rights of minorities and pluralism in the framework of civic lessons.
2. Educational programs concerning human rights issues are routinely conducted throughout the country. Israel has developed special programs such as an annual "Human Rights Day". Each year, this program is dedicated to a different aspect of human rights, and a relevant curriculum and teaching material is developed in both Arabic and Hebrew. In 2015-2016, for example, this day addressed the right of Freedom of Speech as part of the U.N. Universal Declaration of Human Rights (1948), in which the pupils examined the importance this right, as well as the need to balance it with other rights. In 2014-2015, this day addressed the right of Human Dignity, in which pupils were taught about the difference between honor and dignity and how dignity obligates equal rights to all human beings, etc. In 2013-2014, this day addressed the issue of "social responsibility towards the 'other' in society" which focused on tolerance, coexistence, equality, accepting others, etc. In 2012-2013, the topic was "the right for political participation in the society" which focused on political rights, equality, etc.

#### **Programs to Foster Democracy and Tolerance**

3. The Ministry of Education has made a concerted effort to advance principles of democracy and coexistence in its curriculums, and through this educational approach, works to combat all forms of discrimination. In recent years, the Ministry has formulated several educational programs regarding democracy, tolerance and co-existence, which are intended, *inter alia*, for the promotion of human rights and to combat all forms of discrimination. hereinafter are short descriptions of some of these programs:
  - 3.1. Tolerance, Prevention of Racism, and Coexistence Program – is a multi-year program suited for all ages and populations in Israel and focuses on education of tolerance, acceptance of the "other," coexistence and the prevention of racism. The program's goals aim to develop a combined Israeli-civilian identity, commitment for coexistence, tolerance and democratic values.

## Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)

- 3.2. Living Together Program – an educational program facilitating meetings between Jewish and Arab pupils, with the aim of working together for the benefit of both local populations. The pupils are prepared for these meetings where they get to know one another, work together on planning and implementing activities, and learn about coexistence, tolerance, understanding the "other," etc. In 2015-6, 178 elementary schools and 189 intermediate and high schools (12,776 and 5,558 pupils respectively) took part in this program. In addition, 54 kindergartens, 173 elementary schools and 360 intermediate and high schools conducted Arab-Jewish meetings in the frame of this program.
  - 3.3. From Holocaust to Human Rights Dialogue – this program emphasizes the importance of democracy and democratic values such as human rights and pluralism. As part of this program, Jewish and Arab pupils meet to learn and constructively dialogue about World War II and the Holocaust.
  - 3.4. Bridge Among Cultures – The Ministry of Education has developed a new program in which Arab pupils will study Hebrew from kindergarten level to the 12<sup>th</sup> grade. The aim of this program is to enable better economic and social integration of members of the Arab population in the community. In addition, in the frame of this program Jewish pupils will also study Arabic in the 5-6<sup>th</sup> grades.
  - 3.5. "Ya Salam" – a program to promote coexistence and equality through joint Hebrew and Arabic classes in both Jewish and Arab schools. An additional similar program titled "Let's Talk" exposes Jewish pupils to the Arabic language and culture, *inter alia*, by integrating Arab teachers into Jewish schools.
4. In addition, the Ministry also formulated training programs for teachers, aimed at assisting them in effectively introducing human rights, equality, tolerance, coexistence to their pupils. Among the programs offered are: seminars on the fight against racism, human dignity, human rights, etc. The Ministry also allocated an additional 100 teaching hours to schools that wish to promote coexistence and/or democratic values. Hereinafter are several further examples:
- 4.1. Education Against Racism – training for teachers and the entire education staff on how to deal with expressions of racism, how to educate against racist expressions, how to develop and compose a teaching plan on these issues, and how to best implement these into schools and classrooms, etc. This program is aimed for pupils in intermediate and high schools.
  - 4.2. Me and "The Other" – a training program aimed at training teachers on the use of educational contents and programs about tolerance, acceptance while deepening their understanding about violence within Israeli society and ways of fighting it. The program provides teachers, and thereby their pupils, with tools to deal with conflicts and diversity in Israeli society, prevent violence, and with knowledge regarding human rights and democratic values. This program is aimed for teachers and pupils in intermediate and high schools.
  - 4.3. "Key to the Heart" Program – this program focuses on teaching children from 4<sup>th</sup> grade and up about the culture, society, history, faith and language of the Jewish and Arab populations. The program nurtures democratic values, respect, tolerance, openness, critical thinking, and empathy, while providing

## **Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)**

concrete examples of implementing these values into daily life and in the context of the Jewish-Arab partnership. As part of this program, meetings between pupils from Jewish and Arab schools are facilitated throughout the year – both in order to meet and get to know "the other" and in order to work on and promote a joint community project. Currently this project is conducted in 20 schools in the mixed Jewish-Arab city of Ramla in central Israel.

- 4.4. Training of Kindergartens Staff in Acre on Tolerance and Coexistence – this program trains staff to educate children between the ages of three and six on studying and playing together, coexistence, and tolerance. This program is available for pupils and the children's parents.
- 4.5. Living Together through Art – a nationwide program that trains art teachers from both Jewish and Arab schools on how to write a teaching plan for children in 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grades on tolerance towards others. As part of this program, Jewish and Arab pupils meet in order to produce joint works of art under professional supervision. These works are later displayed in four museums. An additional similar program is titled "Dialogue and Identity" also aimed for children in the 5<sup>th</sup> and 6<sup>th</sup> grades.
- 4.6. Israeli Hope – a program led by the Ministry, with the participation of the Israeli President and the Lautman fund, aimed at acknowledging schools that have made significant contribution to education partnership and commitment to integration in Israel. 119 schools participated in this program in 2015.
5. The Ministry also operates an initiative that encourage Jewish and Arab pupils to study together for a variety of subjects such as mathematics, English and civil studies - either through face to face meetings or via video-conference and other technological means.
6. In addition, the Ministry operates a project to eliminate stereotypes and racism within Israeli society by facilitating meetings between various populations, attended in the recent year by approximately 17,000 pupils.

### **Dissemination of Human Rights Conventions to Pupils**

7. The English, Hebrew and Arabic text of the CRC Convention is available on the website of the Ministry of Justice, and in Hebrew and in English on the Ministry of Education website – a popular website for Israeli pupils and students. The Ministry of Education also contains the Pupil's Rights law 5761-2000, and friendly information on the child's rights within the family and within the school.

### **Measures Taken to Review Textbooks**

8. The Ministry of Education's Study Books Branch is responsible for the approval of all textbooks and teaching materials for all education institutions in Israel. This branch operates to keep all textbooks and teaching materials up-to-date, and it is also responsible to review all textbooks and teaching materials for both general content and the educational content specific to the field of study.
9. In accordance to the Ministry's Director General Guideline No. 6 titled "Teaching Methods" of May 3, 2015, and its sub-section 6/3-16 titled "The procedure for receiving approval of textbooks and teaching materials," their obligation is to ensure that "teaching material will include adequate and un-stereotyped

## **Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)**

representation of both genders, and of all populations in the Israeli society, suitable to the requirements of the relevant educational program."

### **Training Provided for Law Enforcement Officers**

#### **The Institute of Legal Training for Attorneys and Legal Advisers in the Ministry of Justice**

10. The Institute of Legal Training for Attorneys and Legal Advisers in the Ministry of Justice regularly conducts many seminars, courses, and vocational training - attended by hundreds of practitioners - to raise awareness of human rights issues and eliminate racial discrimination. In recent years, the training focused on the following issues: The fight against racism and prevention of discrimination (January 2014), The Arab population in Israel (November 2011, June 2015), Equality – the law as a tool for the promotion of equality in the society (October 2013), The battle against trafficking in persons (October 2013, March 2015, March 2016), Equal rights for persons with disabilities (September 2011), human rights in international law (December 2014, November 2015) and Equality (October 2014, November 2015 and planned for November 2016). There are additional seminars on topics such as freedom of speech versus incitement, social rights, etc.

#### **The Institute of Advanced Judicial Studies**

11. The Institute holds lectures, seminars, and courses for judges on various forms of discrimination in the legal context. During 2015-2016, these seminars included: trafficking in persons, the rights of children, the struggle against racism and discrimination, and human rights and the criminal process. Similarly, in 2014-2015, the Institute held lectures, seminars and courses for judges on various human rights issues such as trafficking in persons, equality and non-discrimination and immigration and refugee law.

#### **The IDF**

12. The School of Military Law hosts multiple training exercises for IDF forces on human rights and the law of armed conflict. These exercises include lectures and academic courses which provide both practical and theoretical applications of international law. The purpose of these exercises is the implementation of international law with a focus on the laws of armed conflict within the IDF by analyzing real and fictional operational cases designed specifically for the participants and their military specialty. In addition, commanders and the IDF's International Law Department take part in operational exercises in order to provide examples of situations that arise on the battlefield that will challenge the commanders, as well as provide them with professional and analytical tools that will allow them to face such challenges in accordance with international law.
13. Every year, hundreds of lectures are given to IDF soldiers and commanders who serve their mandatory service, as well as to reserve soldiers. These exercises place a specific emphasis on complicated issues such as arrest and detention practices, the legal duties of a soldier, and commanders' legal responsibilities, as well as the laws and rules of conduct during an armed conflict.

## **Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)**

14. Note that with regard to human rights content, a special emphasis is placed on the legal obligation towards civilian populations, such as: the prohibition of using civilian population for military purposes, the rights of prisoners and detainees, the prohibition of using threats and physical force during questioning in the field, the principle of equality, etc.

### **The Israel Security Agency (ISA)**

15. In recent years, the Legal Department of the ISA and dozens of ISA personnel have undergone specific training on international law, including human rights law, the core human rights conventions, and the work of the Human Rights Treaty Bodies.
16. Moreover, ISA operational personnel are taught, in detail, about the relevant human rights conventions, including their implications in the unique Israeli context. This is done both during preliminary and continued ISA training. These courses and seminars instill the importance of human dignity and fundamental human rights principles, together with upholding of the rule of law and practices stipulated by the courts.

### **The Israeli Police**

17. The Police Education and Information Section operates educational programs aimed at ensuring that various values are incorporated into police officers' work, such as tolerance within a multicultural society, elimination of prejudice, and raising awareness of the relevant human rights conventions.
18. The educational programs are run both through a special workshop and within the overall police training program that includes seminars and courses. In the last few years, special emphasis is given to training police commanders at all levels, since they are in the best positions to influence their subordinates.
19. The Police School for Investigation and Intelligence incorporates into its training the main provisions of the relevant human rights conventions and law of armed conflict regarding procedures and investigation ethics, including "right and wrong" behaviors.

### **The Israeli Prisons Service (IPS)**

20. IPS officers and wardens undergo regular training through the School for IPS Officers and Wardens, as well as within their respective units. Training regarding the relevant human rights conventions is an integral part of the general IPS training at the unit level, as well as in specific courses given to officers and wardens. This training includes topics such as prevention of the use of force, warden's ethics, and values of human dignity and liberty, and the rights and liberties of the prisoner. These issues are also routinely addressed during training and guidance of other prisons' staff member. Also, ethics and values workshops were held for prisons senior staff.
21. In particular, in the recent years there have been workshops for all staff members at the "Saharonim" and the "Givon" detention facilities regarding identifying victims of trafficking in person. These workshops were conducted by the National Anti-Trafficking Unit in the Ministry of Justice. Further, all staff members responsible for youth incarceration (criminal defense) undergo specialized training for working with the youth while carrying out their duties. The professional training for IPS

## Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)

staff focuses on the unique characteristics of the youth population, guidelines, and the special requirements in Israeli and international law regarding minors.

### **The Population and Immigration Authority**

22. The Population and Immigration Authority personnel who are trained to be part of the Refugee Status Determination Unit (RSD) undergo a four-week course on topics specifically related to refugees and asylum seekers. This includes the 1951 Refugee Convention, relevant human rights conventions and Israeli laws, and trafficking in persons awareness. The course was co-developed and first conducted in 2009 by the Ministry of Interior, UNHCR, the Hebrew Immigrant Aid Society (HIAS), and the United States Department of Homeland Security.
23. Detention Review Tribunals Judges for custody of persons who entered Israel illegally undergo specialized trainings with respect to issues of detention, trafficking in persons, the procedure for filing an asylum request, detention of minors, and more. Hereinafter are several examples of training that they underwent during 2014-2016: a seminar on global migration and the fight against trafficking in persons (March 2016) - this seminar included lectures regarding the updated situation of global migration, the situation in Israel, legal dilemmas and challenges in handling issues of migration and trafficking in persons and assistance that is provided to victims of TIP in Israel. An additional seminar focused on identification of torture victims (the phenomenon of the Sinai camps) (November 2015). This seminar included lectures on identifying such victims, their right to legal aid, their legal status, the physiological symptoms of those victims, interview techniques, and more. An additional seminar (December 2014) focused on trafficking in persons - legal challenges and dilemmas, and identification and treatment of victims. Various other training courses focused on additional issues, such as the treatment of accompanied and non-accompanied minors. Similarly, during 2013-2015, judges of the Appeals Tribunal underwent specialized training on trafficking in persons and the Sinai victims. These courses included topics such as identification of trafficked victims and the Sinai victims, information on smuggling and the heinous crimes these victims suffered prior to their arrival to Israel, the meaning of holding vulnerable populations in custody, detention alternatives for minors, and gender-related persecution, such as domestic violence, forced marriages, trafficking, and exploitation of women.

### **Cooperation with the Civil Society and the Academia in Promotion of Human**

#### **Right**

24. In addition, recently the State is participating in a series of round tables with grass root civil society organizations and members of the Academia on a number of human rights and social issues. This important project is the result of a recommendation received by Israel in the frame of the Universal Period Review mechanism. Thus, it was decided to conduct a series of meetings in the form of round tables with grass root civil society organizations and members of the Academia on a number of human rights and social issues, with an emphasis of field organizations, in order to hear representatives of organization that generally do not advocate their activities are less heard by the relevant authorities. These meeting are hosted by the Hebrew University in Jerusalem, Haifa University and Sapir Academic College near the city of Sderot in the northern Negev. The issues for

## **Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)**

these roundtables will focus on rights of the LGBT community, equal rights for persons with disabilities, the Bedouin population, the Ethiopian population, Economic and Social rights in the Peripheral areas and women's rights.

### **Promotion of Human rights issues through the Mass media**

25. Israeli main national television channels often broadcast interviews, news articles and television programs related to human rights issues. Some articles contain information for the public and other brings to the screen personal human rights stories. All channels deal with all human rights issues, among others: people with disabilities, children at risk, women status, the protection of women, trafficking in persons, foreign workers, minorities and more. These issues are also covered and dealt with regularly by local television channels. In Addition, both national and local television channels regularly advertise information regarding help centers relevant to human rights issues.
26. Israeli main radio stations also deals with human rights issues through interviews and articles related to the subject. Main radio stations regularly broadcast ads against trafficking in persons, and advertisement regarding other aspects of human rights. The radio stations also bring important information regarding help centers for human rights victims and other important information. These issues are also covered and dealt with by local radio stations.
27. Israeli main newspapers and main internet news sites regularly address human rights issues and publicize news stories and articles regarding the matter. Additional information regarding different help centers for victims of breaches of human rights of can be found on some of these sites.

### **Dissemination of Human Right Conventions**

28. All of the Human Rights Conventions and Protocols that Israel is a party to can be found on the website of the Ministry of Justice in Hebrew, English, and Arabic. Also, the full body of work with the UN Human Rights Committees, including Israeli initial and Periodic Reports, List of Issues and replies to the List of Issues, Concluding Observations, follow-up to Israel's oral presentations and other related documents can all be found on the Ministry of Justice's website.
29. In 2012, the entire collection of Concluding Observations relating to Israel by all the Human Rights Committees were translated into Hebrew and published on the Ministry of Justice's website. Where available, links to the UN translation in Arabic of these Concluding Observations are also published.

### **Question no. 2**

**GOI Reply:** The Governmental Press Office (GPO) in the Prime Minister's Office, is charged *inter alia*, with coordination between the Government and press community and press officials operating in Israel. The GPO regularly handles the organization and coordination of professional conventions and training days, including in relation to issues such as ethics, new-media, the prohibition of shaming, multi-cultural society and more. This is done, *inter alia*, of the understanding that such issues, including other human rights issues, are at the heart of the journalistic profession. Due to the



**Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law)**

importance of human rights, in relevant cases, the GPO initiate and respond to high profile news stories relating to violation of human rights.