



FONDAZIONE ADKINS CHITI: DONNE IN MUSICA

srculturalrights@ohchr.org

30th June 2016

“Submission regarding study on intentional destruction of cultural heritage”

The Fondazione Adkins Chiti: Donne in Musica¹ has chosen to reply to the following question:

What is the impact of the intentional destruction of cultural heritage on the enjoyment of human rights, and particularly, on cultural rights? What is the impact of destruction of tangible cultural heritage on intangible cultural heritage, on cultural practices and beliefs, and on the right of concerned persons to participate in cultural life?

Then Special Rapporteur, Ms. Shaheed, in A/HRC/14/36, proposed a shift from viewing culture as an obstacle to women’s rights to emphasizing the need to ensure women’s equal enjoyment of cultural rights. Current Special Rapporteur, Ms. Karima Bennoune, confirms this innovative approach emphasizing the situation of artists at risk, facing a wide range of violations of their human rights.....[and their right to create and participate in their own culture!] Restriction and control of the arts is common throughout Europe since financial crises and austerity measures have brought severe cuts in public investments, resulting in unemployment among artists and closure of cultural institutions. Ms. Bennoune also expresses deep concern about the ongoing inequalities faced by women in the arts and endorses the call for the collection of sex disaggregated data on women’s participation.

It is understood within the musical world that “*talent alone is not sufficient for the success of a professional career*” however the status of women artists is endangered and questioned every day, and equal opportunities are far from being a reality. Music is an essential part of Cultural Heritage for all countries and all peoples. Women were traditionally music makers in ancient civilisations² and yet in today’s world they battle against discrimination, harassment, and politically incorrect gatekeepers, but continue to smile when they hear “*there are no women composers of quality*” while continuing to teach tomorrow’s generation of male musicians and composers.

Donne in Musica and its network in 113 countries believe that Music is both Tangible and Intangible. Tangible when written down, available in manuscript or printed form and found in libraries and archives. Intangible when performed since music can be heard but not held in one’s hands.

If music is not performed it is not perceived to exist.

While appreciating and undersigning the work undertaken by Freemuse – *Art Under Threat 2015* – where great attention is paid to the dramatic lack of artistic freedom in Latin America, China, Iran, Tunisia and Turkey, we are sorry no mention is made of the systematic boycotting, discrimination against, lack of public space and finance and even elimination of what women composers create everywhere else in the world including the European Union. European women represent about 60% of music teachers in state and public institutions and in some countries 80% as private music teachers. They are composers and creators of music, performers in all

¹ Please see attached document “*Donne in Musica – Profile*”

² *Jamila e le Altre* Women as Musicians from Sumerian Civilization until 1492. Researched and edited by Fondazione Adkins Chiti: Donne in Musica, Editore Colombo, Roma 2007

fields, music and record producers, publishers, critics, historians, copyists and often responsible for organisational and administration for festivals, teaching institutions, music clubs and media networks. However, even when they teach composition in schools, conservatories or universities, conduct choirs, orchestras or bands, their inclusion as authors of music in mainstream events is minimal. Current data confirms that less than 3% of women's music (traditional, popular, classical and contemporary) is programmed by public funded institutions in Europe³ and 89% of public arts and culture institutions are directed by men.⁴ If, as ongoing research confirms more than 30% of all European composers and creators of music are female, why do so few women receive performances of their works by publicly funded organisations? Why is public money (52, 32% of which comes from female tax payers) used to promote male aesthetics and creativity?

Our network in 113 countries confirms the above figures in their own different geographical areas (Americas, Asia and Australasia, North Africa, Eastern Europe) and underline that the “fortunate” European women are at least visible through their work in teaching institutions: in some countries women may teach privately or only in girls only schools. So we understand why women find it difficult to earn a living from musical composition and eventual ensuing performing rights and in many countries, (including Italy and other EU countries) their music-generated income is below national poverty level. Few countries give composers (men or women) creativity sabbaticals, stipends, worthwhile commissions, a guaranteed number of performances of new works, finance for research, recording, promotion and production, thereby leaving skills and talents unexploited, damaging artistic dynamism, influence and economic development. Performances depend upon a complicated system of funding, patronage, and power play. Look at current music curricula (schools, conservatories, universities) or listen to what public funded organisations (orchestras, festivals, theatres, radio, television, jazz bands) are programming and ask yourself: “*where are the women?*”

Current market philosophies value products in terms of commercial appeal and ability to create revenue. As less public funding is available and alternative funding lacking, so the range of musical experiences in every community diminishes. Presenters and promoters prefer to present well-known music and a soloist, composer, ensemble, or line-up that a ticket paying public will pay for. Full houses (or stadiums) are expected if organisers programme the works of great masters (long dead and white with beards), film soundtracks, electro, heavy metal, impro, dance music, synth-pop or award winners, the impression being that all of these are created by men!⁵ In 1998, a group of European publishers ran an empirical enquiry into the role of women working in commercial and pop music and their research revealed a “*lack of confidence shown by record companies toward women – as composers, writers, and performers*”. They also included complaints about “*sexual harassment for women in the business*” and, what one well-known rock singer and author described as “*media interest in raw flesh but not talent*”.

All forms of creativity depend on multiple factors: age, race, religion, nationality or geographical area where the artist is born, where he/she trained, and aesthetic canons transmitted throughout history, education and specialised training, as well as other external influences such as popular culture, economic conditions, climate and biological age. Awareness of the changes experienced by women worldwide, even in the last one hundred years, has not translated into corresponding levels of participation and influence in public life, or recognition that women's cultural presence in the mainstream is severely constrained by the marginal and under-sourced nature of their organized activities.⁶

³ *European Key Changes for Women in Music and the Performing Arts* edited by Patricia Adkins Chiti, Novecento Media, Italy for European Parliament, 2014. French Ministry of Culture until 2009; WIM-UK from 1995-2013; H/F France 2010–2013; KVASt, Sweden 2010–2013; *Culture-Gates, Exposing Professional Gate Keeping*, ArCult Media, Bonn, 2004.

⁴ France, 2011, the « *Commandes d'état* » (paid commissions to professional composers) were given to 38 men and 5 women – i.e. 11, 6% and in 2012, 52 were given to men and 6 to women – i.e. 10, 3% - no difference in 2015”.

⁵ “Stadium gigs generated more than £220 m. while box office receipts and the associated spend from these events were responsible for two thirds of 2011's live growth. The future of music at grass roots level and beyond looks in good health, particularly with the implementation of the Live Music Act in October 2012” “*Money & Business – Adding up the UK Music Industry*”, *M46*, December 2012, UK.

⁶ World Commission on Culture and Development, *Our Creative Diversity : report of the World Commission on Culture and Development*, direction Javier Pérez de Cuéllar, USA, UNESCO, 1995

Women artists are consistently subjected to gender based discrimination and absence of information about their creativity confirms that society is neither truly multicultural, nor in conformity with Article 27 of the *Declaration of Human Rights*⁷ or Articles 3-6 of the *Recommendation concerning the Status of the Artist*.⁸ There are more young women than young men producing music when they're at school but then they're not encouraged to continue and look at their talent as a future possible lifetime engagement – they are told they should study other things. This is a very pernicious form of discrimination – erasing the dreams of future generations! Ageism is another form of discrimination for women: it is subtle and constant. Far too many artistic and funding opportunities are for “*under thirty fives*”. But all artists (men and women) insist that the production of high quality works comes from years of writing, listening to public performances: like good wine, quality and talent improve with age and experience.

Many women set up their own ensembles, groups, bands, record company or home publishing to guarantee visibility and continuity for their music. Thousands of highly professional women composers (and obviously men as well) watch the dwindling large scale opportunities due to stringent arts funding while protesting that the existing opportunities continue to go to composers backed by powerful advocates. They complain that their work is subject to artistic directors or record producers: commissions, performances, programming all depend upon the magic word – “*quality*” as in a “*woman would have been included if she had the same qualities as a man*”. There are barriers, hurdles, gates and moats to be passed through and across and the gatekeepers are men who talk about “*quality*” and not about wheels behind the scenes: old boys’ networks, politics, investments from publishers, producers and record companies, special friendships, sexual discrimination, harassment and coercion.

The recent (2014) Italian Cultural Ministry decree granting contributions to national performing arts organisations, theatres, orchestras and festivals, adopted a series of “*algorithms*”⁹ to determine which organisations would receive funding led to (a) closure of music institutions, (b) cuts in programming of all music and especially contemporary works, (c) lack of opportunities for composers and (d) especially for women composers. (When there is little money available for programming, works by women take second place), Discussions have even been raised in the press as to whether young people should be encouraged to enter conservatories.

We are constantly reminded that the cultural and creative sectors’ contribution to the European GDP is 4 %, with an increasing trend and more than 7 million jobs. Unfortunately, research reveals that, notwithstanding the considerable number of EU directives and legislation, guidelines, publications and proposals, nothing is done to ensure that women obtain the equal opportunities proposed, nor is there any systematic monitoring of the violations of European legislation which take place every day, every week of every year.

Recent discussions during the “*Creators Conference*” in Bruxelles,¹⁰ covered diverse topics (Artistic Freedom and Digital Opportunities - The Value of Creativity - Fair Deals for Creators - Sustainability in Digital Exploitation - Shaping a European, More Modern Copyright Law - Creators for Europe - Europe for Creativity) while underlining that European countries are not always creating conditions that foster culture, creativity and intercultural exchanges. Few composers (male or female) feel their rights are protected – nor do they truly feel that they have total freedom of expression.

In 2012 MEP Silvia Costa, President of the European Parliament’s Culture Commission, invited this Foundation to research and list the legislation, publications and proposals produced by EU countries and international institutions, regarding access and gender mainstreaming for women in the performing arts in general and for women in music in particular. Results confirmed that even though almost every EU country has a desultory

⁷ United Nations Department of Public Information, *Universal Declaration of Human Rights*, 10.12.1948, p.14.

⁸ United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation, *Recommendation concerning the Status of the Artist*, 27.10.1980.

⁹ A far cry from a careful investigation and discussion of the works to be programmed: music cannot be measured by numbers of tickets being sold or by the size of halls for the presentation.

¹⁰ Organised by ECSA (European Composers and Songwriters Alliance) in June 2016.

number of documents (proposals, papers, guidelines, laws) referring to gender equality, only a small number of these mention “culture”, “women artists” or “performing arts”. The word “woman” is absent from 99% of all documents referring to Cultural Policy.¹¹ Ten countries have no materials whatsoever referring to women in the arts and culture: Bulgaria – Cyprus – Estonia – Rumania – Greece – Latvia – Malta- Netherlands – Poland – Slovakia.

The EUP March 2009 Resolution on Equality of Treatment and Access for Men and Women in the Performing Arts (2008/2182(INI)) addressed to all European governments and institutions invited them to implement proposals contained underlining “that discrimination against women holds back the development of the cultural sector by depriving it of talent and skillstalent requires contact with the public in order to achieve recognition.” It underlines that “inequalities in career prospects and opportunities between women and men in the performing arts are very much present and persistent...the mechanisms which produce these gender inequalities should be seriously analysed..... (and encourages) Member States to produce comparative analyses of the current situation in the performing arts in the various countries of the Union, to draw up statistics in order to facilitate the design and implementation of common policies and to ensure that the progress achieved can be compared and measured”. To date no country in the EU has undertaken the “comparative analyses” invited.

Donne in Musica, in Italy, has been collecting and monitoring data for women composers and public performances of their music since the nineteen-eighties¹² and several other European Women in Music organisations (in Sweden, Germany, France and England) regularly research and publish statistics for their own countries. Recent data from the French Culture Ministry confirms, however, that 98% of all public funding for music still goes to works by male composers.

Women constitute the majority of European citizens but their access to decision making positions in many fields, including the performing arts, is limited.¹³ The performing arts include all forms of theatre (prose, opera, operetta, ballet, dance, musical comedy, variety, marionettes), music (symphonic, chamber, traditional, electronic, jazz, pop, rock, world music, impro, sound installations) circus and street performance. Employment for composers and creators of music in the Western World is characterised by temporary contracts so they must be prepared to work on an intermittent basis on their principal artistic activity while experiencing periods of unemployment (or underemployment). Income consists in payments or contributions from different areas – salaries, unemployment benefits (in some countries), paid commissions (in others), fees, percentages from performing or collecting rights societies. Added to the unstable economic situation in which artists normally live, women artists also face discrimination in the moment when they would like to, or already have, children: it appears that producers of television, advertising or films unwillingly outsource work to a woman composer with small children And yet creativity and motherhood are an essential part of a woman’s life.

“The core issue here is that within a diversified society and arts community, its history, practice and critical debate, some actors are seen as far more equal than others. This presents the paradox of the creative process - diversity rich in inspiration, but (with) the distribution and consumption of the creative product being delivered through a network of exclusive clubs thanks to the never ending work of generations of gatekeepers... Artistic creativity, placed at the margins of society through structural barriers, antiquated and exclusive approaches, has to be brought to the centre of our culture and valued accordingly.”¹⁴

¹¹ UK Music Industry and the Alliance for Diversity in Music & Media (ADDM) launched “Equality and Diversity Charter for Music” in September 2012.

¹² *Žene i Muzika u Srbiji Women and Music in Serbia*, Del Gallo Editore srl, Spoleto (PG) 2011

Women and music in Montenegro. Editore Colombo, Roma 2007

Culture-Gates, Exposing professional gate keeping ArCult Media, Bonn, 2004

Pyramide ou Pilliers - Unveiling the Status of Women in Arts and Media Professions in Europe ArCult Media, Bonn 2004

L'accès des femmes à l'expression musicale: Apprentissage, création, interprétation : les musiciennes dans la société

IRCAM/Centre Pompidou L'Harmattan, Paris, 2002 (French)

¹³ European Institute for Gender Equality, *Facts of inequality between women and men in arts, culture and education*, 2012

¹⁴ Arts Council England, *What is the Creative Case for diversity?* 2010,

[http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/media/uploads/pdf/What is the Creative Case for Diversity.pdf](http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/media/uploads/pdf/What_is_the_Creative_Case_for_Diversity.pdf), p. 8, 9.

In conclusion we can see that the lack of access to participation in cultural heritage, and to the creation of tangible and intangible cultural heritage far from being publicly debated and changed, continues to perpetrate lack of artistic freedom for women of all ages – from school years till advanced old age. Therefore the world continues to receive a mono cultural projection of ideas from a few rather than ongoing exciting input from many and diverse directions. Some music practitioners and stakeholders contend that men have the same difficulties as women: looking at the picture from a distance this might seem true but then when we read the small print and see what sort of music is being programmed (new classical music, re-interpreted traditional music, popular commercial forms or soundtracks for film and theatre) we are forced to ask ourselves “ *but where are the women?*” Numbers are important too.

Patricia Adkins Chiti¹⁵

Headquarters: Teatro Comunale, Piazza Trento e Trieste 1, Fiuggi Città

Tel: 0039 0775 168 56 35

forum@donneinmusica.org www.donneinmusica.org

Member of International Music Council, UNESCO

Member of European Music Council

International Non Governmental Organisation in official partnership with UNESCO

Library and Archives under tutelage of Italian State Archival System

¹⁵ **Patricia Adkins Chiti, President, Fondazione Adkins Chiti:Donne in Musica**, musician and musicologist, created “*Donne in Musica*” in 1978 building a network of women composers, musicologists and educators in 113 countries. Former Italian commissioner for Equal Opportunities she is consultant to institutions in Europe, the Americas and Arab world, commissions music, produces festivals, undertakes research, publishes books and supports *women in music* organisations worldwide. The Foundation is a member of the International Music Council, UNESCO, and the European Music Council. www.donneinmusica.org