Country Cambodia

Submission

By

Prof. Kasumi Nakagawa and her students (name list in Annex XI)

Faculty of Social Science and International Relations

Pannasastra University of Cambodia (PUC)

# **Introduction**

This paper responds to “Call for Inputs - Report of the Special Rapporteur on the sale and sexual exploitation of children, including child prostitution, child pornography and other child sexual abuse material”, and answers are noted according to the Questionnaire provided by UNOHCHR.

**Surrogacy situation in Cambodia:**

Surrogacy was banded in Cambodia in November 2016 by the decision from Ministry of Health (prakas, signed October 24, 2016). Article 12 of the prakas reads: “Surrogacy, one of a set of services to have a baby by Assisted Reproductive Technology, is banned completely”.[[1]](#footnote-1) Available data shows that there were in total 66 children born out of surrogacy, and 5 children have left Cambodia already while 32 children became legal children of surrogate mothers, and whereabouts of other 29 children are unknown. The Royal Government of Cambodia is in the process of the drafting of the law on surrogacy but the contents are not accessible to the public.

# **Part 1. Identity, origins and parentage**

## **Describe safeguards protecting identity rights (CRC art. 7 and 8) that are currently being implemented in your State.**

1. **National legal framework**
2. Constitution of Cambodia has stated on the Chapter III which are about “the rights and duties of Khmer Citizens”.
* Art. 31 and Art. 48 explicitly refers to the CRC and Art. 48 states, “The State shall assure the protection of children’s rights as enshrined in the Convention on Children, especially, the right to life, the right to education, the right to protection during wartime and the right to protection from economic or sexual exploitation.”
1. Law on Nationality:
* Art. 4 states: “shall obtain Khmer nationality/citizenship, by having been born in the Kingdom of Cambodia: any child who is born from a foreign mother and father (parents) who were born and living legally in the Kingdom of Cambodia.” Thus, the child that was born out of surrogacy would consider gaining rights the same as normal Cambodian citizens, including the rights to protect to know and protect their origins and cultural heritages.
1. Law on Inter-Country Adoption:
* Article 46, it states “An adopted child who has reached a sufficient age and level of maturity to understand the consequences of knowing his/her identity ***may be allowed*** access to his/her dossier, including the identity of his/her biological parents, upon written application with the Central Authority of the Kingdom of Cambodia, if it is in the adopted child’s best interests. An adopted child who has reached the age of majority shall be entitled to access his/her own dossier, and other records concerning his/her identity. The ICAA shall ensure that the adopted child receives appropriate counselling before accessing information in his/her dossier. ” Therefore, although there has been no legal interpretation of “may be allowed”, technically speaking, any child may not be allowed to access to their identity.
1. Prakas on Minimum Standards on Residential Care for Children
* In Article 3, on Social and Cultural Development section, it states that residential care institutions shall provide children "The right to know and assert their identity including name, ethnicity, nationality, religion and languages, and full right to choose their own religion without any discrimination, and the children are not forced to profess any religion in exchange for care" and “Permission to contact their family, even when the child is at risk of harm by the family, if it is the wish of the child, if it is in his/her best interests and if the visit takes place under the supervision of the staff.”
1. **International framework**
2. Convention on the rights of child (CRC), ratified by Cambodia in 1992, article 7 and 8 and its optional protocol (OPSC)
3. Cambodia has also ratified the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially women and children.

## **Describe how the right to access origins is balanced with the right to privacy of parents and gamete donors. Indicate specifically how the best interests of the child are factored in.**

There has been no case on this matter, therefore no legal interpretation is possible.

However, as above noted, Article 46 of ICA law states “An adopted child who has reached a sufficient age and level of maturity to understand the consequences of knowing his/her identity ***may be allowed*** access to his/her dossier, including the identity of his/her biological parents, upon written application with the Central Authority of the Kingdom of Cambodia, if it is in the adopted child’s best interests.” Therefore, it can be possible that for the best interest of a child, parents may keep secret about a child’s identify from him/her.

According to the opinions of the university students, mostly, Cambodian parents do not disclose their children about the adoption if he/she was adopted. Or, if a child is born out of gemmate, parents may not inform their children about their donor information. There is a biased perception towards adoption, and parents may tell a lie to their children about their origins. Commonly, Cambodian parents may not have ideas about how to tell the true origin, therefore even when they may decide to tell the truth, the process of telling the origins is not easy and often require much time. Cambodian parents would commonly consider that keeping secrete is the best interest of a child.

## **Describe safeguards protecting the family environment (CRC art. 7, 8, 9, 10, 20) that are currently being implemented in your State.**

1. National Legal framework
* The Constitution law in article 31, article 33, article 47 and article 48 had stipulated the right and obligations of Khmer citizen and it related to human rights.
* Civil code, article 985, article 987 and article 988.

## **Specify how the establishment of parentage occurs in the context of surrogacy arrangements. Indicate specifically how the best interests of the child are factored in.**

The Phnom Penh municipal court made a decision that when the intended (biological parents) can send their DNA to Cambodia and it is proved that a child born out of surrogacy is their child, then a child can leave Cambodia to his/her parents country.

However, this decision was not applied for later two cases, therefore, it could be understood that this decision is not applicable to any further cases. There is no law to establish parentage in the context of surrogacy.

# **Part 2. Sale of children**

## **Provide information on the laws prohibiting the sale and trafficking of children.**

1. National Law and Policy:
2. Law on Suppression of Human Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation (2008)
3. Policy on Protection of the Rights of Victims of Human Trafficking and Prakas on the Implementation of that Policy (2009)
4. Prakas on Minimum Standards for Protection of the Rights of Victims of Human Trafficking (2009)
5. National Plan of Action 2014-2018 to combat trafficking in person
6. Labor Law (1997)
7. Criminal Law (2009)
8. Bilateral Agreement with other Countries:

*China*

1. Agreement b on Strengthen cooperation of Counter Trafficking in Persons (2016)

*Vietnam*

1. Agreement on Bilateral Cooperation Eliminating Trafficking in Women and Children and Assisting Victims of Trafficking (2005)
2. Cooperation Agreement on Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) for the Identification and Repatriation of Trafficked Victims (2009)

*Thailand*

1. Bilateral Cooperation for Eliminating Trafficking in Persons and Protecting Victims of Trafficking (2014)
2. Bilateral Cooperation for Eliminating Trafficking in Children and Women and Assisting Victims of Trafficking (2003)
3. Strengthening the management of the repatriation and reintegration of human trafficking victims (2019)

## **Describe any safeguards against the sale of children and child trafficking specifically created for surrogacy arrangements.**

Surrogacy is understood as “child trafficking”. There are several safeguards against the sale of children and child trafficking in Cambodia, but there is none specially in the context of surrogacy arrangements. Therefore, any transfer of a child can be understood as “child trafficking” regardless of how the transfer is arranged.

Applicable laws for the above interpretation is (1) Law on Suppression of Human Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation and Criminal Code. The Law on Suppression of Human Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation consists of some articles that describe crimes related children trafficking and selling such as: Article 8: Definition of Unlawful Removal, Article 9: Unlawful Removal, inter alia, of Minor, Article 10: Unlawful Removal with Purpose, Article 11: Unlawful Removal for Cross-border Transfer, and Article 42 and 43 which talk about sexual intercourse and incident act with and against minor under fifteen years old. Additionally, the Criminal code also states certain crime related action such as article 332-Intermediary between an adoptive parents and pregnant women. These existing two laws create basis to deal with the issue of surrogacy. However, no specific law has been adopted that intends to solve any problem around the surrogacy arrangement.

1. **Comment on the adequacy of current safeguards against the sale of children and child trafficking in the context of surrogacy arrangements.**

Despite the fact that law-making process requires great amount of time, the current response for safeguarding children’s rights is far from satisfactory.

We have witnessed inhuman treatment for surrogate mothers.At least 32 surrogate mothers who were arrested in June 2018 were all forced to accept those children born out of surrogate and raise them. This is inhuman treatment for both mothers and children who did not intend to fall into such a situation. The state should allow biological parents to receive their own children as of 5 cases in 2016 arrests.

## **Note situations and provide data, if any, where a lack of safeguards have allowed or unduly risked violations of these norms in the context of surrogacy arrangements.**

In total, 66 children were born out of surrogacy, and only 5 children were known to have left Cambodia to be raised by their own biological parents.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Year | Number of surrogate mothers | Children’s whereabouts |
| Nov. 2016 (regulation of surrogacy was not effective yet) | 23 (18 were pregnant at the time of arrest of the offenders) | 5 children were brought to their intended parents, other 18 babies unknown  |
| Nov 2018(surrogacy was banned by the ministerial order) | 11 mothers were arrested  | 11 children’s whereabouts are unknown |
| June 2016 | 32 mothers were arrested  | All 32 children became the Cambodian surrogate mothers’ children (otherwise any mother who refused to take a baby would be punished by law; 20 years imprisonment) |

In June 2018, 32 surrogate mothers were arrested under the violation of the ministerial order to ban surrogacy and they were given two options; (1) to accept a child as their own child or (2) to face 20-year imprisonment according to the criminal code. All 32 mothers agreed to take a baby with them and raise them as their own babies and all children were provided Cambodian nationality. However, provided the fact that most surrogate mothers were from the very poor families desperately needed money, there is a huge potential that they may not be able to raise those “foreign” children as their own. They may sell a child, they may exploit a child, they may neglect a child, or they may abandon a child. With an absence of a clear regulation, it is unclear how those children are informed about their birth.

## **Note the number and types of cases where safeguards against the sale of children have been used in criminal cases in the context of surrogacy arrangements.**

There were three cases as above, and agencies/intermediaries were arrested, not surrogate mothers. 32 surrogate mothers arrested in June 2018 were all released after they agreed with the authority that they would take those babies as their children and raise them.

# **Part 3. Data**

1. **For countries where surrogacy is prohibited, please indicate the number of cases, on an annual basis, where nationals have made a surrogacy arrangement abroad and have returned to their country of origin with the surrogate-born child.**

There is no record on this accessible to the public.

1. **Indicate under which circumstances authorities have allowed their nationals to bring the child born from a surrogacy arrangement back into their country of origin and if so please indicate which ones (e.g. domestic parenting orders, judgements, best interests of the child determinations, etc.), and how often they have been used.**

There is no record on this accessible to the public. According to the law on nationality, any child born from Cambodian parents will be given a Cambodian nationality, therefore, it depends how Cambodia Embassy in foreign land deals with this. Legally, Cambodian parents may need to adopt their child born out of surrogacy, however, there has been no case on this, therefore, it depends how the court applies the law.

1. **Lastly, in the same context, please indicate how many cases have led to the non-recognition of parentage orders established in the State where the surrogacy arrangement occurred.**

As above section reported, out of 66 children who were born out of surrogacy arrangement, only 5 children were allowed to leave Cambodia and received by their own biological parents, and other 61 children were denied the biological parentage. At least 32 children became surrogates’ legal children.

# **X. Bibliography**

Ate Hoekstra, Sineat Yon. (2018, December 6). *The Telegraph*. Retrieved May 20, 2019, from https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2018/12/06/love-boy-cambodian-surrogates-forced-keep-babies-say-will-bear/?fbclid=IwAR2Fr-24Li1cgExDdoI2x7AedVRSZiFD7vC54umb9Teu8YcG1W94DC95aqs

*BetterHealth Channel*. (n.d.). Retrieved from Surrogacy: https://www.betterhealth.vic.gov.au/health/HealthyLiving/surrogacy

BillinBCN, (2016, November 22).*Surrogacy in Cambodia Faces First Official Charges.* *Retrieved from Sensible Surrogacy.com:* [https://www.sensiblesurrogacy.com/
surrogacy-in-cambodia-comes-to-end-amidst-arrests/](https://www.sensiblesurrogacy.com/surrogacy-in-cambodia-comes-to-end-amidst-arrests/)

BILLinBCN. (2017, Frebulary 15). *Sensible Surrogacy*. Retrieved may 20, 2019, from https://www.sensiblesurrogacy.com/australian-mother-and-son-arrested-for-providing-surrogacy-in-cambodia/

Brigitte, C. (2012). *A Balancing Act? The Right of Donor-Conceived Children to Know their Biological Origins.* Retrieved from Georgia Journal of International And Comparative Law. Vol 40, No.3

CRC. (2013). *General comment No. 14 (2013) on the right of the child to have his or her best interests taken as a primary consideration*. Retrieved from United Nation

ECOSOC. 2014. "Children’s Rights in Kingdom of Cambodia ." https://uprdoc.ohchr.org/uprweb/downloadfile.aspx?filename=442&file=EnglishTranslation.

Handly, Erin. 2016. "Surrogacy Ban Lack force of Law." *Phnom Penh Post.* https://www.phnompenhpost.com/national/surrogacy-ban-lacks-force-law.

Justice, E. C. (2012). SURROGATE MOTHERHOOD: A VIOLATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS.

K.R Daniel. (1998). *The Views of Semen Donors regarding the Swedish Insemination Act 1984.*

Kong Meta,(2018, February 2). *Only half of surrogate paperwork approved.* *Retrieved from:* https://www.phnompenhpost.com/national/only-half-surrogate-paperwork-approved

Kunthear, M. (2019, April 08). *Police push for more education on surrogacy*. Retrieved from KHMER TIMES : https://www.khmertimeskh.com/50594354/police-push-for-more-education-on-surrogacy/

Laurence Brunet. (2018). *Donor anonymity and right of access to personal origins*, 8.

Matt Bloomberg, T. 2019. *Bussiness& Human Rights Resource Center.* May 19. Accessed May 24, 2019. https://www.business-humanrights.org/en/cambodia-rights-groups-urge-govt-not-to-criminalise-surrogate-mothers-with-new-law.

Meta, E. H. (2019, May 12). *Cambodian surrogates face an impossible choice — forced motherhood, or years in prison*. Retrieved from ABC News: https://www.abc.net.au/news/2019-05-12/cambodian-surrogates-forced-to-be-mothers-or-face-prison-time/11086640

Meta, K. (2018, November 14). *The Phnom Penh Post.* Retrieved May 20, 2019, from: https://www.phnompenhpost.com/national/surrogacy-suspects-charged?fbclid=IwAR3BAMZeVAjQ6NWuSmgEJ-35vAazHa3dFw2a6S456lbm3S0md3XED4kofI0

Meta, K. (2018, September 28th). Kingdom surrogacy law set to lift burden from ‘victims’ . Retrieved from Phnom Penh Post: https://www.phnompenhpost.com/national/kingdom-surrogacy-law-set-lift-burden-victims

News, B. (2018, December 06). *Cambodia releases surrogate mothers who agree to keep children*. Retrieved from BBC News: https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-46466888

OHCHR. (1996-2019). Convention on the Rights of th14e Child, adopted and opened for signature, ratification and accession by General Assembly resolution 44/25 of 20 November 1989, entry into force 2 September 1990, in accordance with article 49

OHCHR. 2018. “Surrogacy and the sale of children.” March. Accessed May 22, 2019. https://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Children/Pages/Surrogacy.aspx.

Okhean, Ben. 2018. *Long awaited surrogacy draft law finalised.* Accessed 2019. https://www.phnompenhpost.com/national/long-awaited-surrogacy-draft-law-finalised.

Petra De Sutter. (2019). *Anonymous donation of sperm and oocytes: balancing the rights of parents, donors and children*, 1-2.

[Phan Soumy](https://www.cambodiadaily.com/author/phan-soumy/),(2017, April 19). *Government Publicly Announces Exit Strategy for Surrogate Babies. Retrieved from Cambodiadialy:* [https://www.cambodiadaily.
com/news/government-publicly-announces-exit-strategy-for-surrogate-babies-128161/](https://www.cambodiadaily.com/news/government-publicly-announces-exit-strategy-for-surrogate-babies-128161/).

REUTERS. (2019, May 18). *Cambodia urged not to criminalize surrogate mothers with new law*. Retrieved from The Asahi Shimbun: http://www.asahi.com/ajw/
articles/AJ201905180015.html

Rights, U. N. (1989, November 20th). Convention on the Rights of the Child . Retrieved from OHCOR: https://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CRC.aspx

S2010. "The constitution of Cambodia." *WIPO.* https://www.wipo.int/edocs/lexdocs/laws/en/kh/kh009en.pdf.

Sarah Taguiam “Kids’ safety improving”. (2015, February). *Posted by The Phnom Penh Post:* https://www.phnompenhpost.com/kids-safety-improving-report

Sensiblesurrogacy. (n.d.). Surrogacy in Cambodia. Retrieved from https://www.sensiblesurrogacy.com/surrogacy-in-cambodia/

Source, H. Y. (2018, January 22). *After woman finds her baby via surrogate unhealthy, Chinese surrogacy agency says she can ‘return it’ for new one*. Retrieved from GLOBAL TIMES : http://www.globaltimes.cn/content/1086012.shtml

Vida, T. (2018, November 29). *Surrogacy law progresses*. Retrieved from KHMER TIMES : https://www.khmertimeskh.com/553934/surrogacy-law-progresses/

Vida, Taing. 2018. *Surrogacy law progresses.* Accessed 2019. https://www.khmertimeskh.com/553934/surrogacy-law-progresses/.

World Vision Cambodia (November 20, 2014) “Cambodia Children Need Better Protection” Retrieved from https://www.wvi.org/cambodia/pressrelease
/cambodian-children-need-better-protection

World Vision, “CHILD PROTECTION – Policy Brief 2017” The World Vision Org, accessed May 24, 2019, https://www.wvi.org/cambodia/publication/2017-policy-brief-child-protection-cambodia-eng

Yon, D. K.-O. (2018, December 13). *Poverty and demand from China fuel illegal Cambodia surrogacy*. Retrieved from Ali Jazeeera: https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2018/12/poverty-demand-china-fuel-illegal-cambodia-surrogacy-181211042242119.html

Legal Document

*Civil Code of Cambodia, article 985, 988, 987.*

*Constitution of Cambodia (1993), article 31, 33, 47, 48.*

Law on Inter-Country Adoption, 2009, Chapter III, VII.

Law on Nationality of Cambodia article 2, 3, 4

Law on Nationality, Promulgated 1996, Chapter II.

Law on Suppression of Human Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation (2008), Article 8, 9, 10, 11

Law on the Marriage and Family

Prakas on Minimum Standards on Residential Care for Children, 2006, Chapter II.

Royal Decree on the Establishment of the Cambodia National Council for Children, Chapter III.

# **Name list of students who participated in this submission**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| CHAN Lyheng | SATH Sokphearath |
| CHAN Ye | SEM Sreypich |
| CHHAY Dechkunn | SOK Sothsovichea |
| CHHEAV Phanarith | SOUN Dina |
| CHHON Hongkong | SUM Solita |
| CHHORN Sopheap | SUN Sam Ol |
| EK Sunheng | SUON Kimhongsopheaktra |
| EM Vannet | SUOS Sorya |
| HEANG Sopheak  | SY Somnang |
| HENG Salyta | THOENG Brotyaks |
| HUY Sovanphearak | THOEURNG Brosnoch |
| HY Sovannneka | THOEURNG Kampul |
| KARTEAT Krima | TUON Raksmey |
| KEO Bona | TY Muy Eng |
| LEANG Kuntheavatey | UM Srey Pech |
| LIM Ghekhuoy | VANNA Neariroth |
| LONG Puthearith | VIN Puthealy |
| LYM Sothanarath | YIM Kimtheng |
| MEAS Pagna | NHA Long |
| MEAS Sophal | NOEURN Narin |
| MEY Pheak | NUTH Satya |
| MOEUN Solynna | PHY Savorn |
| MON Meng Ean | REAM Ranny |
| NEAM Sreyleak |

1. There has been an legal argument that this decision was not based on the law. This prakas must be consistent with the law, but there is currently no law outlawing surrogacy. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)