



General Assembly

Distr.: General
17 May 2013

English only

Human Rights Council

Twenty-third session

Agenda item 3

**Promotion and protection of all human rights, civil,
political, economic, social and cultural rights,
including the right to development**

Report of the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children, Joy Ezeilo

Addendum

**Mission to the Philippines: comments by the Government on the report
of the Special Rapporteur***

* Reproduced in the annex as received.

Comments of the Government of the Philippines on the mission report of the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children

I. General comments

1. The Philippines takes note of the *Report of the Special Rapporteur on trafficking in persons, especially women and children on her Mission to the Philippines* (A/HRC/23/48/Add.3) which examines the situation of trafficked persons and the impact of anti-trafficking measures in the country. The Philippines recognizes the integral role of the Special Rapporteur in promoting a human rights-based approach to combat trafficking in persons, especially women and children.

2. The Philippines would nonetheless like to clarify certain inaccuracies in fact and law in the report. The Philippines believes that some parts of the report contain sweeping generalizations that were based on unsubstantiated allegations or isolated incidents that do not reflect the actual conditions in which the Philippines pursues its campaign against trafficking in persons. Through its laws and programs, the Philippines is further intensifying its campaign against trafficking in persons, by allocating its limited resources aimed at progressively realizing the full protection of the population, especially the sectors most vulnerable to the economic pressures of trafficking.

II. Comments on main findings

A. Forms and manifestations of trafficking in persons

(a) Trafficking for forced and bonded labor

3. With respect to the comments in paragraph 4 of the report, the Philippine Government wishes to stress that, in 2012 alone, it carried out the following operations and programs in furtherance of its campaign against trafficking for labor exploitation:

- The Department of Labor and Employment undertook rescue operations through *Sagip Batang Mangagawa*¹ Quick Action Teams, in which *two hundred and twenty three (223)* victims, were rescued from conditions of forced labor or other labor-related violations.
- The Regional Offices of the Department of Labor rescued and assisted at least *three hundred seventy five (375)* victims of trafficking for labor exploitation:
- To enhance the legal regime against trafficking for the purpose of labor exploitation, the Expanded Anti-Trafficking Act of 2012, which was enacted after the visit of the Special Rapporteur, modified the definition of forced labor to include “any work or service extracted from any person under the menace of penalty”², based on the definition of forced labor by the International Labor Organization. The statute also included among its definitions new paragraphs defining “Slavery” and “Involuntary Servitude”³; and it contains a new provision punishing as a distinct offense

¹ “Save Child Laborers”

² Republic Act No. 9208, as amended by Republic Act 10364, Section 3(d), last clause.

³ Republic Act No. 9208, as amended by Republic Act 10364, Section 3(e),(f).

recruitment of persons for labor exploitation, including coercion of a worker through threats against other persons and abuse or threatened use of legal processes⁴.

- To strengthen the institutional capacity of the government to combat trafficking for labor exploitation, the Department of Labor and Employment developed the *Manual of Procedures in Handling Complaints on Trafficking in Persons, Illegal Recruitment and Child Labor* in 2012. The Department of Labor and Employment also developed a *Module on Child Protection Laws* which was integrated into its advocacy programs, and conducted other advocacy programs, including Orientations on Child Labor and Trafficking.
- The Philippine Government is finalizing a *Manual on Trafficking in Persons for Forced Labor*, based on Philippine laws and policies and international best practices, which will provide judges, prosecutors, law enforcement officers, social workers, and other persons engaged in ant-trafficking work with a one-volume guide in the identification and prosecution of incidents of trafficking for the purpose of labor exploitation.

(b) *Trafficking for domestic servitude*

4. With respect to the comments in paragraph 9 of the report, the Philippines wishes to stress the shared responsibility of source, transit, and destination countries to combat trafficking in persons, protect the human rights of migrant workers, and provide assistance to trafficking victims.

5. The Philippines is working to facilitate international cooperation and compliance with international minimum standards for the protection of domestic workers. It ratified the Domestic Workers Convention (ILO 189) and chaired the Committee that developed it. The Philippines has also signed a Memorandum of Agreement with the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia on a new Standard Employment Contract (SEC),⁵ which the Philippines intends to replicate in other receiving countries, especially in the Middle-East. The Philippines likewise supports the *Framework of Regional Collaboration, 2012 for the Abu Dhabi Dialogue*. Among the important provisions of this Framework are: increased collaboration and partnerships to ensure welfare and protection of contract workers; enhancement of the employability and skills of workers; improvement of the recruitment process; and facilitation of the re-employment and reintegration of workers.

6. The Philippines is of the view that the comments in paragraph 11 of the report are sweeping generalizations which are not supported by accurate quantitative data and do not reflect the conditions of the majority of domestic workers in the Philippines. It further notes that it is implementing reform measures to enhance the protection of domestic workers within the Philippines, such as the *Kasambahay Act* (Republic Act 10631 or “An Act Instituting Policies for the Protection and Welfare of Domestic Workers”) and the *Household Service Workers (HSW) Reform Package*, which is being supervised by the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration (POEA).

⁴ Republic Act No. 9208, as amended by Republic Act 10364, Section 4(j).

⁵ The new Standard Employment Contract contains 19 articles that spells out clear and specific provisions on salary (minimum of \$400) and the manner of its payment (through a bank account to be opened by the employer domestic worker in Saudi Arabia; rest hours (at least 8 hours of continuous rest) and rest days (at least one day per week); and paid vacation leave in the Philippines (30 days for every two years of service with free round-ticket economy class air ticket).

(c) *Trafficking for sexual exploitation*

7. The Philippines rejects the sweeping generalizations in paragraph 14 of the report, particularly its statement that the “exploitation of children, especially girls, for sex tourism is alarmingly common and sometimes socially and culturally tolerated in many areas of the country.”⁶ These generalizations appear to be based on a small and unrepresentative sampling of anecdotal evidence⁷ and not on accurate quantitative data. The Philippines, however, shares the concern over the reported cases, and as a state party to the Convention on the Rights of the Child, is actively enforcing the following laws to protect children from all forms of sexual exploitation, in addition to those specifically cited in the report:

- The *Revised Penal Code* of 1930 (Act No. 3815 as amended) punishes anyone who promotes or facilitates the prostitution or corruption of minors with up to six years’ imprisonment⁸. Anyone who has sex with a woman below twelve years old will suffer up to forty years’ imprisonment⁹; and any person who sexually assaults anyone below twelve years old will suffer twelve years’ imprisonment, or up to twenty years’ imprisonment if the act was attended by aggravating circumstances¹⁰. Any person who seduces a minor woman over twelve years old may suffer up to four years’ imprisonment¹¹.
- The *Child and Youth Welfare Code* of 1974 (Presidential Decree 603) enacted norms upholding the dignity of every child and the right of children to be protected against exploitation, improper influences, hazards, and other conditions or circumstances prejudicial to their development. Thus it provided rules for the protection of neglected children¹²; required hospitals to report cases of abused, maltreated, or exploited children¹³; and mandated strict confidentiality of records of sexually abused children¹⁴.
- The *Inter-Country Adoption Act of 1995* (Republic Act 8043) and *Domestic Adoption Act of 1998* (Republic Act 8552) enacted safeguards to ensure that adoption will prove beneficial to the child's best interests and that his/her fundamental rights will be protected.
- The *Anti-Trafficking Act of 2003* (Republic Act 9208) punishes persons who use trafficking victims for the purpose of prostitution¹⁵. The *Expanded Anti-Trafficking Act of 2012* (Republic Act 10364) increased the penalty for this offense to six (6) years to twelve (12) years imprisonment, or up to forty (40) years’ imprisonment if the male or female trafficking victim was subjected to force or intimidation, is deprived of reason or unconscious, or is under twelve (12) years of age¹⁶. Furthermore, it expressly provides that if this offense is committed by a foreigner, he

⁶ Mission Report, 14.

⁷ *Vide* Mission Report, 12-15.

⁸ Act No. 3815 (Revised Penal Code), art. 340, in relation to article 27.

⁹ Revised Penal Code, articles 226-A (1) and 226-B, in relation to article 27 as amended by Republic Act No. 7659, section 21 (1993).

¹⁰ Revised Penal Code, articles 226-A(2) and 226-B, in relation to article 27.

¹¹ Revised Penal Code, articles 337-338, in relation to article 27.

¹² Presidential Decree No. 603, article 141-165.

¹³ Presidential Decree No. 603, article 166.

¹⁴ Presidential Decree No. 603, article 166.

¹⁵ Republic Act 9208, section 11.

¹⁶ Republic Act 10364, section 11(a).

or she shall be immediately deported after serving his or her sentence and be barred permanently from entering the country.¹⁷

8. The Philippine Government is even now advocating the passage of a law that would prioritize the rescue of persons forced into prostitution, and which would focus on the criminal liability of users, customers, and business owners complicit in acts of prostitution.

(d) *Trafficking for the purpose of removal of organs*

9. In relation to paragraph 16, the Philippines questions the observation regarding “transplant tourism” in the country as this does not appear to be based on credible and verifiable information, such as documented cases. It likewise wishes to correct the statement on “the absence of any law explicitly prohibiting the sale of human organs from a living donor”. In fact, Section 4(g) of the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003 categorically punishes with twenty (20) years’ imprisonment, or life imprisonment if the act was qualified by certain aggravating circumstances¹⁸, any person who shall:

“recruit, hire, adopt, transport or abduct a person, by means of threat or use of force, fraud, deceit, violence, coercion, or intimidation for the purpose of removal or sale of organs of said person”.¹⁹

10. The Expanded Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2012 further strengthened this provision by including perpetrators who “transfer, obtain, harbor, maintain, provide, offer, receive” these trafficking victims²⁰, and by punishing any person who shall attempt to carry out this offense, or acts as an accomplice in or an accessory to its commission.²¹

B. Identification of trafficked persons

11. In relation to paragraph 43, the Philippines wishes to underscore the fact that its agencies, particularly the Department of Justice, are implementing measures to investigate and prosecute government officials involved in facilitating and promoting trafficking. In furtherance of this objective, up to *five hundred ninety eight (598)* administrative cases have been filed against *eight hundred ninety three (893)* government employees for their alleged involvement in human trafficking.

12. The IACAT is finalizing cooperative arrangements with the agencies responsible for policing the ranks of the civil service. The IACAT and the Office of the Ombudsman have finalized and are ready to sign a Memorandum of Agreement for the formulation of mechanisms to ensure the timely and speedy disposition of trafficking related corruption cases. The IACAT and the Civil Service Commission committed to further educate public officers or employees on the indicators, specific risk, exposure and vulnerabilities relating to trafficking in persons, and to strengthen the imposition of administrative sanctions on public officials and employees for their explicit involvement in trafficking in persons cases. These agencies undertook to formulate the appropriate circulars, orders and code of conduct for public officers and employees with respect to public officers and employees involved in trafficking in persons and to ensure that public officials would not go unpunished for charges or prosecution for their complicity in trafficking in persons cases.

¹⁷ Republic Act 10364, section 11(b).

¹⁸ Republic Act 9208, section 10(a) and (c), now section 10(a) and 10(e)

¹⁹ Republic Act 9208, previously section 4(g), now section 4(h)

²⁰ Republic Act 10364, section 4(h)

²¹ Republic Act 9208, sections 4-A to 4-C.

13. In reference to paragraph 44, as well as the concern raised in paragraph 74 on the sustainability of projects against trafficking, the Philippines notes that it has continually increased the amount of Government financial and human resources dedicated to the campaign against trafficking in persons. Thus, under the administration of President Aquino, the funding for the prosecution and investigation of trafficking in persons was doubled from 25 million pesos in 2011 to 50 million pesos in 2012; and it was doubled again to 100 million pesos in 2013. Likewise, the Philippine Government established and staffed its anti-trafficking task forces in strategic locations nationwide. It also created within the National Bureau of Investigation (NBI) a division specifically dedicated to the suppression of trafficking, namely, the Anti-Human Trafficking Division; and it formed the IACAT Operations Center under the joint supervision of the Office of the Vice President and the NBI.

C. Protection, recovery and reintegration of trafficked persons

14. In reference to the concern raised in paragraph 45 of the report, the Philippines wishes to emphasize that through the intensified capacity-building programs of the government, law enforcers continually receive trainings for purposes of the identification of trafficking victims. Thus, departing personnel are replaced with capable and trained law enforcement officers.

15. In relation to paragraph 47, the Philippines reiterates that the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2003 punishes the trafficking of persons for the purpose of removal or sale of organs of said person²². The Expanded Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2012 further strengthened this provision by including perpetrators who “transfer, obtain, harbor, maintain, provide, offer, receive” these trafficking victims²³, and by punishing any person who shall attempt to carry out this offense, or acts as an accomplice in or an accessory to its commission.²⁴

16. In relation to paragraph 49 of the report²⁵, the Philippines notes that it has implemented measures to progressively realize the full protection of victims and witnesses. Thus, from April 2012 to January 2013 alone, eighty one (81) trafficking victims were referred to the Witness Protection Program (WPP) and given protection, shelter, and financial assistance, aided in many cases by the IACAT Operations Center. To give the witnesses enhanced medical care, the Government enrolled them in its public insurance program administered by the Philippine Health Insurance Corporation, and accorded them preferential treatment at the Philippine General Hospital.

17. The Government also leased several farmlands and developed them into *witness communities*, where witnesses learn farming, poultry, cattle raising and other livelihood skills that tangibly increase their economic self-sufficiency and improve their psychological well-being. The Department of Social Welfare and Development (DSWD) has further established the National Recovery and Reintegration Database to continually monitor the safety and condition of victims.

18. In addition to the shelters operated by the Department of Social Welfare and Development and NGOs, the IACAT Operation Center established a temporary shelter for witnesses and trafficking victims. In 2012, the IACAT Operation Center identified *three hundred ninety three (393)* trafficking victims. *One hundred thirty five (135)* of them were

²² Republic Act 9208, previously section 4(g), now section 4(h)

²³ Republic Act 10364, section 4(h)

²⁴ Republic Act 9208, sections 4-A to 4-C.

²⁵ In relation to Mission Report, 80.

referred to shelters of the Department of Social Welfare and Development, *fifteen (15)* victims were placed at the temporary shelter of the IACAT Operation Center, and the rest were reintegrated with their families.

(a) *Non-criminalization of trafficked persons*

19. In reference to the concern raised in paragraph 50, the Philippines notes that the Expanded Anti-Trafficking Act of 2012 now categorically provides that:

“Victims of trafficking for purposes of prostitution as defined under Section 4 of this Act are not covered by Article 202 of the Revised Penal Code and as such, shall not be prosecuted, fined, or otherwise penalized under the said law.”²⁶

20. Furthermore, the Philippines wishes to emphasize that the primary objects of its punitive legislation are those persons who use trafficking victims for the purpose of prostitution. This is already punished under the Anti-Trafficking Act of 2003²⁷; and the Expanded Anti-Trafficking Act of 2012 further strengthened this norm by raising the penalty to six (6) years to twelve (12) years imprisonment, or up to forty (40) years’ imprisonment if the male or female trafficking victim was subjected to force or intimidation, is deprived of reason, was unconscious, or is under twelve (12) years of age²⁸.

21. The Philippines believes that the statement in paragraph 50 on the “the absence of any opportunity for reintegration” should be corrected. The Philippines notes that the IACAT has established various technical education, livelihood and skills training programs for the rehabilitation and reintegration of trafficked victims into the mainstream of society, which is being carried out in coordination with the Technical Education and Skills Development Authority, the Government agency mandated to register and implement programs for vocational and livelihood education. The Philippines also reiterates that it maintains communities where victims/witnesses learn livelihood skills to increase their economic self-sufficiency, and that it enrolls them in insurance and medical programs to maintain their physical and psychological well-being.

(b) *Rescue operations*

22. In reference to the concern raised in paragraph 51 on the participation of media in raid operations, the Philippines notes that the Philippine Commission on Women, in partnership with the IACAT-Advocacy and Communications Committee (ADVOCOM), is conducting Advocacy Trainings for Media Professionals on Anti-Trafficking. The first of these was held in October 2012 for forty (40) media professionals, who were trained on gender-sensitive reporting of trafficking cases and on other issues on human trafficking and other related laws. The IACAT trained an additional one hundred sixty (160) media personnel on trafficking issues in 2012, while another fifty (50) media professionals were trained on issues specific to trafficking for labor exploitation.

23. In reference to the concern raised in paragraphs 51 and 52 on the protection of victims’ rights during rescue operations, Philippine law fully protects the right of victims to privacy²⁹ and confidentiality³⁰. Thus, the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act, as amended, provides that:

²⁶ Republic Act 10364, section 17, 2nd paragraph.

²⁷ Republic Act 9208, section 11.

²⁸ Republic Act 10364, section 11.

²⁹ Republic Act 386 (Civil Code), article 26, 32(9).

³⁰ Republic Act 9208, section 7 (2003), as amended by Republic Act 10364 (2012).

“At any stage of the investigation, *rescue*, prosecution and trial of an offense under this Act, law enforcement officers, prosecutors, judges, court personnel, social workers and medical practitioners, as well as parties to the case, shall protect the right to privacy of the trafficked person... The name and personal circumstances of the trafficked person or any other information tending to establish the identity of the trafficked person and his or her family shall not be disclosed to the public.”³¹

24. In relation to minor victims of all forms of child abuse, the Operational Procedures of the Philippine National Police expressly protects the right of the child to privacy, and mandates that:

“The police officer shall at all times respect the right to privacy of the child and shall observe confidentiality of information and records pertaining to child rights cases he investigated or is investigating...”³²

25. In cases involving a child victim, the Philippine National Police “shall activate a Rescue Team to be headed by officer/s of the WCPD [Women and Children Protection Desk]”. The child victim “shall be handled preferably by a police officer of the same gender as the victim, who has appropriate trainings on child rights, and in the investigation and handling of child-abuse cases”³³. Furthermore, he/she must be turned over to the Local Social Welfare Development Office (LSWDO) for protective custody.³⁴

(c) *Support to trafficked persons in recovery and reintegration*

26. The Philippines believes that the statement in paragraph 55 citing that a very low number of victims that have benefited from nominal financial assistance should be corrected, because it is contrary to the information verified and compiled by the Department of Social Welfare and Development. In 2012 alone, the DSWD provided assistance in *two thousand one hundred eighty three* (2,183) cases, involving one or more persons, including (a) 1,903 victims of trafficking who were returning or had returned to the Philippines; (b) the families and relatives of the victims-survivors of trafficking; and (c) communities with high incidence of trafficking. From this number, financial assistance was given in 586 cases, skills training or livelihood assistance was given in 124 cases, temporary shelter and recovery/medical services were given in 1,030 cases, legal assistance was given in 141 cases, and *Balik-Probinsya*³⁵ transportation assistance was given in 302 cases. The various forms of economic assistance enabled the victims to either start their own livelihood or finance their expenses while seeking employment, while the transportation assistance helped the TIP victims to return to their places of origin.

(d) *Support to trafficked persons in recovery and reintegration*

27. The Philippines wishes to correct the last sentence in paragraph 54. In fact, the Philippines provides multiple layers of support for the repatriation of distressed nationals, including victims of trafficking. The Migrant Workers Act provides that the repatriation of the worker shall be the primary responsibility of the agency which recruited or deployed the worker overseas³⁶; and where emergency repatriation is required, it shall be undertaken by

³¹ Republic Act 9208, section 7 (2003), as amended by Republic Act 10364 (2012). Emphasis supplied.

³² PNPM-DO-DS-3-1 (Operational Procedures of the Philippine National Police), Rule 27, section 2 (March 2010).

³³ Operational Procedures of the Philippine National Police, Rule 27, section 3(c), 4th paragraph.

³⁴ Operational Procedures of the Philippine National Police, Rule 27, section 1(e)

³⁵ Literally, “Return to the Province”

³⁶ Republic Act 8042 as amended by Republic Act 10002, Section 15.

the Overseas Workers Welfare Administration (OWWA)³⁷. The law created an emergency repatriation fund under the administration, control, and supervision of the OWWA, initially consisting of one hundred million pesos (P100,000,000.00)³⁸.

28. In the particular case of trafficking victims, the Expanded Anti-Trafficking Act provides that the Department of Foreign Affairs shall repatriate them with their consent.³⁹ The Filipino victim is given temporary shelter in the Foreign Workers Resource Center (FWRC) pending the prosecution of trafficking cases abroad; and when the FWRC is not available, the Foreign Service Post exhausts all other possible means to provide temporary shelter to the victim, through the NGOs, Filipino Community leaders, or private accommodation providers like hotels and apartments. Such assistance is rendered at no cost to the victim; and all the expenses for assistance to victims are usually sourced from the Assistance to Nationals (ATN) Fund or the Legal Assistance Fund, which are adequately funded and readily available. It is illegal for the Department of Foreign Affairs personnel to charge victims for lodging, and any who do so are subject to administrative disciplinary proceedings.

29. The Philippines believes that the last sentence in paragraph 59 should be corrected. The particular facility visited by the Special Rapporteur in Zamboanga was provided by the Government with publicly owned premises for its operation; and it is managed by a civil society organization (CSO) with historically adequate international funding and support. Consequently, it received assistance from the Department of Social Welfare and Development only upon the specific request of the CSO. Three of the shelters managed by this CSO are now fully funded by the Government, which assumed joint responsibility for their operation.

30. In reference to paragraph 61, the Government has recognized the different needs of male and female victims of trafficking that require specialized care or services. This is the reason for the establishment and continued maintenance of shelters like Marillac Hills and the Haven which cater to the special needs of women and girls who are trafficking victims. Likewise, female Immigration Officers of the Bureau of Immigration with sufficient background on gender and development (GAD) are tasked to assist profiled female victims during the interview and other processes conducted by the Bureau. As for the male victims, the Department of Social Welfare and Development, through its Policy Development and Planning Bureau, issued a policy directive to ensure special care for male trafficked victims. A program for a specialized support program for male victims and a safe and separate temporary shelter was pursued by the DSWD Field Office in the National Capital Region. A center for male trafficking victims was established in Jose Fabella Center in Mandaluyong City, which will be fully operational in 2013. To continuously address the special needs of male trafficked victims, specific program enhancement and exploration of other field offices are outlined in the Second IACAT Strategic Plan.

31. The Philippines believes that paragraph 62 should be corrected. The National Referral System (NRS) for the Recovery and Reintegration of Trafficked Persons of the Department of Social Welfare and Development is being implemented to establish and strengthen the referral network of agencies dealing with trafficked persons. At present, the network facilitates rescue operation work and provides for referral needs of rescued trafficked victims, while also enabling TIP law enforcement and prosecution of cases. All rescued trafficked persons are provided with temporary shelters, counseling, legal assistance and referral to services.

³⁷ Republic Act 8042, Section 15 (1995); Omnibus Rules, Rule XIII, sec. 5, 8

³⁸ Republic Act 8042, Section 15 (1995); Omnibus Rules, Rule XIII, sec. 8

³⁹ Republic Act 10364, Section 16(a), 1st paragraph, last sentence

32. To ensure the reintegration of victims, each Regional Office of the Department of Labor and Employment designated focal persons to manage cases of Trafficking in Persons, Illegal Recruitment and Child Labor cases. The following services are being provided by the Department of Labor and Employment: (i) Financial Assistance; (ii) Educational Assistance for children at risk; (iii) Skills training; and (iv) Livelihood Assistance. For the year 2012, the Department identified *two hundred fifty one (251)* cases of human trafficking.

D. Investigation, prosecution and punishment

33. In reference to paragraph 63 of the report, the Philippines respectfully refers to the response contained in paragraph 3 of this document. Further, the Philippines wishes to clarify that under its law, it is natural persons and not corporations as such that are charged criminally; hence, in cases involving acts perpetrated through licensed agencies, it is the officers and employees of the agency who are indicted⁴⁰. The Philippines notes that multiple cases of illegal recruitment have been filed against natural persons connected to licensed agencies. In 2011, 19 illegal recruitment cases involving 37 complainants were filed against licensed agencies; and in 2012, 8 illegal recruitment cases were filed involving 22 complainants.

34. In reference to the conduct of POEA officials, the POEA has demonstrated it will not tolerate corrupt and illegal acts by its officers, who would be subject to investigation over offenses like the irregular issuance of Overseas Employment Certificates. Thus, the POEA Administrative Complaints Committee handled 9 cases in 2011 and 2012, four of which have led the filing of formal charges, even against supervisory POEA personnel. In addition, a Special Fact-finding Committee was created in December 2012 to investigate the processing of 7 workers as *Balik-Manggagawa*, alleged to be new-hires.

35. The Philippines wishes to correct the statement that only one case of labor trafficking referred to the Department of Justice in 2011. In fact, the POEA referred seven (7) cases of labor trafficking to the IACAT for case build up in 2011.

36. With respect to paragraph 65, the Philippines wishes to highlight that there has been a significant 67% increase in the number of convictions under the administration of President Benigno S. Aquino III, which demonstrates the Government's continuing resolve to investigate, prosecute and punish all acts of trafficking.

37. In connection with the measures created by the Government to facilitate the prosecution of TIP cases, the Department of Justice established a case monitoring program to detect and address the delays in the resolution trafficking cases, a major component of which is the expansion of the scope of data gathered on trafficking cases. The Office of the Solicitor General (OSG) likewise agreed to assist IACAT to fulfill its comprehensive campaign to investigate cases of trafficking in persons by constituting "IACAT-OSG Anti-Human Trafficking Task Force."

38. In reference to the concern raised over the length of judicial proceedings, the Philippines notes that this is founded on the presence of multiple safeguards required to equally protect the right of victims to redress and the right of the accused to due process of law, as one of the internationally recognized fundamental rights. Among other remedies, Philippine law generally allows a party to file a petition for *certiorari*⁴¹ against the actions of the trial court for committing "grave abuse of discretion amounting to lack or excess of

⁴⁰ Republic Act 8042, section 6, as amended by Republic Act 10022.

⁴¹ Rules of Court, Rule 65

jurisdiction”⁴². These may be filed even in the middle of a trial to prevent the alleged grave abuse from affecting the proceedings beyond redress.

39. In light of the foregoing, the Philippines Government is implementing measures to ensure the speedy and just resolution of judicial proceedings. Thus, the Supreme Court has issued the Judicial Affidavit Rule⁴³, which requires parties to submit the judicial affidavits of witnesses in place of their testimony on direct examination, and to attach the parties’ documentary evidence to these judicial affidavits. Moreover, in reference to trafficking in persons, the Office of the Court Administrator directed judges to hear and try trafficking cases expeditiously,⁴⁴ and to submit reports on the status of trafficking cases pending before them.⁴⁵

40. Furthermore, to prevent parties from abusing the safeguards that protect their rights and from using them to delay the proceedings, the Department of Justice issued Department Circular No. 57 directing all prosecutors to prioritize and expedite the resolution and trial of human trafficking cases and to vigorously oppose motions designed to delay the case.

E. Redress

41. In reference to the concern in paragraph 67 of the report, please refer to the comments in paragraphs 38 to 40 of this document. In addition, the Philippines wishes to note that under the Civil Code of the Philippines, compensation through the payment of moral damages may be given to persons who underwent “physical suffering, mental anguish..., social humiliation, and similar injury”⁴⁶ through the acts of an offender, including in cases of trafficking for sexual exploitation, which is analogous to “seduction, abduction, rape, or other lascivious acts”.⁴⁷ Furthermore, compensation through the payment of exemplary damages may be awarded in addition to the payment of moral damages or when the crime was committed with one or more aggravating circumstances.⁴⁸

III. Comments on conclusions and recommendations

A. Conclusions

42. In reference to the concern raised in paragraph 77 of the report, the Philippines wishes to emphasize that it is presently carrying out measures to ensure the coordinated and uniform implementation of the anti-trafficking law, through the Second National Strategic Action Plan Against Trafficking (2012-2016), which was launched on December 12, 2012. This comprehensive operations plan, which was formulated by a multi-sectoral group composed of Government agencies and NGOs, is divided into four (4) Key Results Areas: Advocacy and Prevention; Protection, Recovery, Rehabilitation and Reintegration; Law Enforcement and Prosecution; and Partnership and Networking. Each component maps the activities to be implemented in a systematic manner by Government agencies, NGOs and other stakeholders at the local, regional and national levels, provides tangible standards to

⁴² Philippine Constitution, article XVIII, sec. 1; Rules of Court, Rule 65

⁴³ Administrative Matter 12-8-8-SC.

⁴⁴ OCA Circular No. 151-2010, 26 October 2010.

⁴⁵ OCA ^{Circular} No. 151-2010, 26 October 2010.

⁴⁶ Republic Act 386, as amended, article 2217

⁴⁷ Republic Act 386, as amended, article 2291, 1st paragraph and article 2219(3)

⁴⁸ Republic Act 386, as amended, article 2229-2230.

assess anti-trafficking endeavors, and gives overall direction in the implementation of the amended anti-trafficking law.

43. The Strategic Action Plan includes measures to enhance the institutional capacity of agencies that investigate, prosecute, and try the perpetrators of trafficking; and to facilitate inter-governmental coordination in intelligence-gathering and enforcement. It likewise proposes intensified media campaigns to encourage partnerships with private citizens in anti-trafficking efforts; and it seeks to mobilize the resources of all stakeholders. Most of all, it seeks to improve the delivery of services to trafficking victims and to empower them for their reintegration into society through education and economic independence. In so doing, they may even become active partners in protecting other potential victims.

44. With respect to the points addressed in paragraph 78 and the recommendation in paragraph 83(d) of the report, the Philippines wishes to note that it has conducted numerous programs, trainings, and fora for government officers to boost the awareness and anti-trafficking expertise of law enforcement and other frontline public officers.

45. The IACAT has carried out programs for the capacity development of law enforcement officers (intelligence agents, immigration officers, policemen and even members of the marine corps), prosecutors, judges, social workers, labor officers, local government personnel, as well as members of non-government organizations and civil service organizations, by organizing *one hundred four (104)* trainings and seminars to strengthen anti-trafficking approaches and responses in their area of jurisdiction.

46. On 1-4 October 2012, the Department of Social Welfare and Development's Social Technology Bureau conducted the Training of Social Workers on Social Case Study Writing and Project Documentation to enhance the reporting and documentation skills of officers working on cases of trafficked persons. Participants attended from the sixteen regions of the Philippines, as well as from the Autonomous Region of Muslim Mindanao. All the *seventeen (17)* Field Offices of the Department also conducted Roll-Out Trainings on the Recovery and Reintegration Program for Trafficked Persons at the LGU levels.

47. The Department of Labor and Employment conducted numerous programs including: Orientation on Child Labor and Trafficking, Capacity Building for Members of the *Sagip Batang Manggawa*⁴⁹—Quick Action Teams, and Orientation of Public Employment Services Office Managers on Child Labor. About *two hundred fifty (250)* government personnel have been trained on TIP by the Department of Labor and Employment. Towards the 4th quarter, the regional implementers of the Department of Labor and Employment were also trained on the procedures to handle cases on trafficking in persons, illegal recruitment, and child labor; specifically, on obtaining vital information for prosecution based on the Manual developed by the Department of Labor and Employment.

48. The Regional Offices of the Department of Labor and Employment also conducted various trainings relating to trafficking within their respective regions.

49. The Philippine Overseas Employment Administration, in line with its mandate to implement an effective pre-employment orientation seminar and a comprehensive and integrated program on overseas employment, conducted Anti-Illegal Recruitment/Trafficking in Persons Seminars, Pre-Employment Orientation Seminars and Capability Enhancement Trainings. In 2012, *forty-eight (48)* Anti-Illegal Recruitment/Trafficking in Persons Seminars were held nationwide, primarily for law enforcement officers, local government officials, Public Service Employment Office

⁴⁹ Literally, "Save Child Workers"

employees, and prosecutors. These were attended by 4203 persons, of whom *ninety percent (90%)* are government personnel.

50. On June 25 and July 9, 2012, the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration conducted a training entitled “Effective Litigation and Trial Techniques Seminar” for *sixteen (16)* of its Legal Officers to enhance their trial skills as collaborating counsels for illegal recruitment.

51. To further enhance the delivery of government services in relation to trafficking cases, a skills enhancement training for case officers of the 1343 Actionline against Human Trafficking was conducted at the Institute of Women’s Studies-St. Scholastica’s College from 15-16 December 2012. Case officers from the Commission on Filipinos Overseas, the Philippine National Police, the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration, the Department of Social Welfare and Development, and the Department of Science and Technology participated in the training.

52. Various line agencies conducted an orientation seminar on government programs addressing illegal recruitment and human trafficking for the employees of Public Service Employment Offices in local government units.

53. Agents from the Anti-Human Trafficking Division and the International Airport Investigation Division of the National Bureau of Investigation underwent training in 2012: through the “Capacity Building Training on TIP” conducted by IACAT in Tanza, Cavite Province, on August 29-31, 2012; and the “Trafficking in Persons Training” conducted by International Law Enforcement Academy in Bangkok, Thailand on July 16-27, 2012 and December 10-21, 2012.

54. In order for the Bureau of Immigration to be better equipped in the fight against human trafficking, *four hundred four (404)* of its regular employees and *two hundred seventy three (273)* of its confidential agents attended trainings on the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act and other TIP-related laws. The Bureau also sent representatives to participate in several international training programs like the 2nd Conference on Technical Cooperation and Capacity Building for Border Management in Thailand, the Capacity Building for Frontline Border Control Officers to Combat People Smuggling in Cambodia and the Expert Group Meeting on Corruption and Smuggling of Migrants in Vienna, Austria.

55. The Philippine Center for Transnational Crime organized a Training Workshop on the new Standard Operating Procedures for Trafficking in Persons Investigations of the Philippine National Police. Likewise, under INTERPOL’s Capacity Building Programme on the Prevention of Migrant Smuggling and Illegal Migration in South East Asia with the sponsorship of the Canadian Government, it sent participants from local agencies abroad for training on TIP.

56. In partnership with the International Organization for Migration for the Campaign Against Illegal Recruitment, Trafficking in Persons and Irregular Migration (CAIRTIM), *twenty nine (29)* personnel of the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration attended a Trainers Training on February 6 & 7, 2012. This aimed to provide updates on the Overseas Employment Program, and to further build the capacity of resource persons to conduct Anti-Illegal Recruitment/Trafficking in Persons Seminars and Pre-Employment Orientation Seminars nationwide.

57. A total of *one thousand six hundred sixteen (1,616)* personnel from all the regional offices of the Philippine National Police received Anti-Trafficking related training in 2012. The Philippine National Police-Maritime Group, Women and Children Protection Desk also conducted a Specialized Crime Training and Operation Workshop under the INTERPOL Capacity Building Program on the Prevention of Migrant Smuggling, Phase 3.

58. As to the concerns raised in paragraph 79 of the report, please refer to Paragraphs 11 and 34 of this document. The Philippines further notes that, in addition to their administrative cases, criminal charges for violation of the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act, Child Abuse, and Illegal Recruitment have been filed against a number of these government officials for their alleged involvement or complicity in human trafficking cases.

59. In reference to the concern raised in paragraph 80 of the report, the Philippines has adopted multi-sectoral strategies to progressively increase the numbers of trafficking cases that are investigated and prosecuted by the Government. Thus, from April 2012 to January 2013, the prosecution offices have received two hundred nine (209) complaints for alleged TIP violations, of which sixty three (63) were initiated by the IACAT Task Forces. Of these, one hundred fifty three (153) cases have been filed with the Regional Trial Courts for violation of the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act while sixty-five (65) cases are pending preliminary investigation for other offenses such as Illegal Recruitment, violation of the passport law, and child abuse or child pornography under the Anti-Child Abuse Law of 1992. For related comments, please see paragraphs 36 to 40 and 16 to 18.

60. The Philippines would like to stress that the factors discussed in paragraph 82 of the report are currently being addressed by the Philippine Government through its anti-poverty initiatives. Among these programs is the Conditional Cash Transfer (CCT) Program administered by the Department of Social Welfare and Development. It provides direct financial assistance to impoverished households to improve the health, nutrition and education of their members, particularly children aged 14 and below, and to break the inter-generational cycle of poverty. Since its inception up until to 2011, a total number of Two Million Three Hundred Forty Five Thousand, Six Hundred and Thirty Nine (2,345,639) households have received assistance under the CCT.

61. For 2012, a total of 39,444,651,000.00 pesos was allocated for the program, which was distributed to 775,891 families. In 2013, the allocation for the program was increased to 44,255,644,000.00 pesos; and as of 27 February 2013, 730,161 families have already benefited from this allocation. This program had a significant impact on the campaign of the Philippine Government against trafficking as it directly addresses poverty, which makes people more vulnerable to trafficking.

62. The CCT and the Self-Employment Assistance-Kaunlaran (SEA-K) program, which provides capital assistance and income generating opportunities, form the two core poverty reduction programs of the Department of Social Welfare and Development. These aforementioned core social protection programs aim to provide a more sustainable and tangible impact on poverty reduction, and would further alleviate the condition of underprivileged families in trafficking prone areas. The government has also developed a program for skills development and micro-financing that would provide opportunities for entrepreneurship and economic growth.

B. Recommendations

63. The Philippines is of the view that the Government is already implementing the majority of the recommendations made by the Special Rapporteur, and would like to provide the following information:

64. As to the concerns raised in paragraph 83(a) of the report, the Philippine Government notes that it has a centralized repository of relevant information on trafficking, and is also improving mechanisms for gathering data.

65. The Philippine Center for Transnational Crime, which serves as the Secretariat of the National Central Bureau-Manila⁵⁰ and of the Office of the Special Envoy on Transnational Crime⁵¹, gathers and collates data from different government agencies to predict trends in the commission of transnational offenses. Thus, the Philippine Center for Transnational Crime consolidates data in order to analyze the relationships of given factors for the formulation of individual and collective strategies relative to the prevention, detection and apprehension of organized crime groups and other criminal elements.

66. Moreover, in order to put in place a comprehensive database of all the trafficking in persons cases, the IACAT Secretariat created a team to monitor and inventory the cases pending in the Regional Trial Courts of the country. As part of the effort to expedite the resolution of TIP cases, the IACAT monitoring team identifies cases that have been pending for more than 5 years, determines the cause of delay, and reports the same to the Department of Justice for appropriate action.

67. Furthermore, the previously launched Philippine Anti-Trafficking in Persons Database (PATD) is now being integrated with the master file of all the monitored cases gathered by the team. Upon encoding the details of all 1,670 cases, this database will represent the comprehensive case inventory of all the TIP cases in the country. The database is designed to track the progress of the cases at the prosecutor level and those that have been filed in court.

68. In addition, the IACAT recently engaged a team of experts to update the information on TIP cases in the Philippines and to analyze the progress of the said cases. The team of experts, under its contract with the IACAT, shall submit its report not later than 30 September 2013. The Kingdom of Netherlands has confirmed its interest to jointly undertake the said project.

69. The Philippines notes that the recommendation in paragraph 83(d) is already being undertaken by the Philippine Government. For comments, please refer to paragraphs 44 to 57 of this document.

70. As to the recommendation in paragraph 83(f) of the report, the Philippine Government is implementing measures in relation to the structural concerns addressed by this recommendation. Thus, on October 5, 2011, the Secretary of Justice issued Department Order No. 826 reconstituting task forces in the DOJ main office, including the Task Force on Anti-Trafficking in Persons. Furthermore, the Expanded Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act of 2012 expressly provides for the creation of a secretariat to the IACAT to be headed by an Executive Director, who shall be appointed by the Secretary of Justice upon the recommendation of the IACAT.⁵²

71. With regard to the recommendation in paragraph 83(h), the Philippines has consistently recognized, since the enactment of R.A. 9208, that international collaboration is vital to avert the threat of TIP. In this connection, the Philippines, through the IACAT and the individual member-agencies, undertook efforts to strengthen its ties with the international community. Thus, on 28 October 2012, the Philippines and the Netherlands conducted a parallel and simultaneous operation against a group suspected of trafficking for labor exploitation, while Philippine anti-trafficking officials held bilateral exchanges with Netherlands authorities to formulate preventive and combative measures against modern day slavery. The MOA subsequently executed between the representative agencies of the two countries highlighted the importance of international cooperation to address TIP.

⁵⁰ Executive Order 100, section 1 (1999)

⁵¹ Executive Order 265 (2004).

⁵² Republic Act 9208, section 22 (2003), as amended by Republic Act 10364 (2012).

72. Members of the IACAT attended the 6th Session of the Conference of Parties to the United Nations Convention against Transnational Crime and Protocols thereto (COP-UNTOC) in Vienna, Austria on 15-19 October 2012, which was held to review the Three Protocols on Trafficking, Migrant Smuggling, and Arms Smuggling pursuant to Article 32 of the UNTOC. The delegates from the IACAT and the Bureau of Immigration participated in the side event on Trafficking in Persons, where they delivered a presentation on the Philippine Government's efforts to combat Human Trafficking and the practices that led to the dramatic increase in its prosecution and conviction rates. They also took the opportunity to request technical assistance from the UN Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) for the drafting of an Anti-Smuggling of Migrants Bill. At the Philippine delegation's meeting with the UNODC Technical Assistance Unit, the UNODC Technical team signified their readiness to start providing legislative assistance to the Philippines.

73. IACAT representatives attended the Program on Prevention of Migrant Smuggling and Illegal Migration in Phuket, Thailand. The objective was to increase the number of government officers trained in the prevention of migrant smuggling and human trafficking, especially in the networking and sharing of information through the use of INTERPOL's tools and databases, which are available to 187 member countries worldwide.

74. On 28-30 May 2012, a Philippine delegation composed of representatives of IACAT member-agencies attended the Technical Experts Workshop on Combating Trafficking in Persons in Bali, Indonesia, which was held under the auspices of the Bali Process on People Smuggling, Trafficking in Persons and Related Transnational Crime. The Philippine delegates provided a case study of international and multi-sectoral cooperation against trafficking.

75. The work of sharing best practices and building international linkages resumed at the 6th Ad Hoc Group Senior Officials' Meeting of the Bali Process, which was held on 1 June 2012 in Bali, Indonesia. The Philippine Delegation actively worked to build an international partnership that would not only enforce penal laws against human trafficking but also address the social and economic conditions that render potential victims vulnerable to trafficking syndicates.

76. The Undersecretary-In-Charge of IACAT in the Department of Justice traveled to the United States in August 2012 to meet a number of possible partners in raising awareness of trafficking among overseas Filipinos and generating additional support for the Philippines' anti-human trafficking initiatives. The Undersecretary had a series of meetings with the officers of the Integrated Bar of the Philippines, California Chapter, members of the media from the West Coast, and members of key Philippine-American communities. These interfaces resulted in increased awareness on the problem of human trafficking in the target communities in the United States. Further during this trip, discussions on the possibility of a partnership with Fil-Am Legal Development and Education Fund (FALDEF) was explored whereby the FALDEF acts as the IACAT's partner in the United States in assisting Filipino victims of human trafficking as they file and pursue cases against their perpetrators. The creation of similar partnerships in other identified destination countries is now being pursued.

77. With respect to paragraph 83(i) of the report, we note that the Philippine Government observes the policy of zero tolerance for trafficking-related corruption among public officials. To highlight the drive of the government towards this end, please refer to paragraphs 11 to 12 and 34 of this document.

78. In connection with the recommendation in paragraph 83(l) of the report, the Philippines wishes to stress that it supports the victim-centered approach in raid and rescue operations. For information on government acts which reflect this recommendation, please refer to paragraphs 22 to 25 of this document.

79. In reference to the recommendation in paragraph 83(r) of the report, the Philippines would like to note that it has undertaken numerous campaigns to inform and educate the public on human trafficking, especially vulnerable sectors like migrant workers; and it is broadening these public information campaigns in various traditional and emerging media platforms. Thus, awareness-raising programs have been continually carried out by the Government. In the year 2012 alone, the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration conducted *forty eight (48)* seminars on Anti-Illegal Recruitment/Trafficking in Persons. It also conducted *eight hundred sixty two (862)* Pre-Employment Orientation Seminars, which were attended by *One hundred sixty one thousand one hundred sixty six (161,166)* participants. The seminars aim to inform the public of the legal processes involved in seeking overseas employment as well as the risks of illegal recruitment and trafficking in persons. To complement the education campaign seminars, the Philippine Overseas Employment Administration distributed 63,754 printed information and education campaign materials and 335 copies of a series of audio-visual presentation in compact discs.

80. In its second year as the head of the IACAT's Advocacy and Communications Committee, the Commission on Filipinos Overseas conducted Community Education Programs (CEP) in 32 provinces, covering 66 areas and 7 cities in the National Capital Region (NCR) with an estimated *sixty five thousand (65,000)* participants.

81. The Department of Foreign Affairs, primarily through its Foreign Service Posts, conducted 56 public information campaigns, and 45 trainings and seminars designed to prevent Trafficking in Persons.

82. The Philippine Commission on Women, which serves as the primary policy-making and coordinating body on women and gender equality concerns, spearheaded the 18-Day Campaign to End Violence Against Women held on November 25-December 12, 2012. The Commission also organized an information caravan to increase awareness on the Magna Carta for Women, as well as the laws on violence against women and human trafficking. A total of one thousand twenty-one (1,021) persons, including local government officials, law enforcement officers, students, media practitioners and school officials, participated in the caravan.

83. To sustain advocacy efforts, the Women and Children Protection Desk of the Philippine National Police also initiated a continuous public information campaign through the following: (a) *Forty Four (44)* radio interviews on trafficking in persons; (b) *Seven Thousand Nine Hundred Ten (7,910)* dialogues or *pulong-pulong* conducted by the Philippine National Police with a total number of *Sixty Six Thousand Nine Hundred Twenty One (66,921)* participants from different *barangays* (village governments), NGOs and other concerned sectors; (c) *Two Thousand Four Hundred Sixty Three (2,463)* trainings/lectures/seminars on trafficking in which *Twenty Four Thousand Three Hundred Sixty Nine (24,369)* police personnel participated nationwide in 2012; and (d) the printing of numerous materials like posters and leaflets, which were distributed to enhance public awareness on trafficking in persons.

84. In order to increase awareness in identified source areas of trafficking, the Philippine Center for Transnational Crime conducted seven (7) Advocacy Campaigns on Anti-Child Trafficking in several areas in Zamboanga City and Zamboanga Del Norte Province, which it considered to be the areas with the greatest number of potential trafficking victims in Mindanao Island.

85. The National Bureau of Investigation conducted 6 lectures on Trafficking in Person/Illegal Recruitment in different venues. Furthermore, four operatives of the National Bureau of Investigation attended several trainings on Trafficking in Persons conducted by the International Law Enforcement Academy. The National Bureau of Investigation also

produced a music video called 'Trafficked' with the aim of educating the youth on the nature and dangers of human trafficking.

86. The Department of Labor and Employment disseminated information and education campaign materials such as posters, flyers, and handbooks. Moreover, DVDs showing a video entitled 'Enslave' were distributed to Public Employment Service Offices and media outlets. Related articles on Trafficking were also published in local daily papers. Furthermore, a weekly radio program on child labor, Illegal Recruitment, and Trafficking in Persons is currently being produced.

87. In 2012, the Department of Social Welfare and Development intensified its anti-trafficking campaign and advocacy throughout the Philippines. It conducted various orientations, forums, symposia, and community education programs on the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act and on the Anti-Violence Against Women and Their Children Act, organ trafficking, and on the Recovery and Reintegration Program for Trafficked Persons. It completed TV infomercials and audio-visual presentations, which were distributed to its Field Offices and partners. Its Field Offices continued to partner with local radio stations for the regular radio plugging of advocacy materials from the Department.

88. Seven *thousand five hundred (7,500)* bumper stickers, *fifty two (52)* panel boards and fan flyers were likewise distributed to the regions, along with brochures explaining the Department's Rehabilitation Reintegration Program for Trafficked Persons (RRPTP) and its National Referral System. Local government executives and SWDOs were provided CDs that contained radio plugs against human trafficking, the template for anti-trafficking billboards, and other materials.

89. The IACAT launched its Facebook page, twitter account and YouTube channel in March 2012, to increase awareness of IACAT's work. The official IACAT website, iacat.net, was re-launched on the month of July 2012. It contains basic information regarding IACAT and its partners in the public and private sectors. The said website is likewise linked to IACAT's twitter and Facebook pages with real-time updates. The website also publishes the status of filed TIP cases and areas in the Philippines where these cases were filed, which allows the public to monitor the progress of the cases.

90. The various taskforces of IACAT likewise conducted numerous TIP public awareness campaigns. In particular, they held a symposium at the Lyceum College in Intramuros, Manila, on the related laws on trafficking in persons, particularly on the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act, to foster awareness to the youth on the dangers of human trafficking. A total of *two hundred (200)* students attended the symposium.

91. IACAT's Region V Task Force conducted eight (8) awareness programs and trainings consisting of lectures, seminars and meetings.

92. A seminar/dialogue on the Anti-Trafficking in Persons Act and the Anti-Child Abuse Law of 1992 was conducted for Hotel Operators, Owners, Managers and Security Officers in Cebu City, Mandaue City and Lapu Lapu City, all in Cebu Province.
